

F]bXYf\U`hi b[`]a `C VYfU``[Ài . `6Y\ ÒfXYb
VYghÀh][Yb `fY[Y`a À»][Y `? c b h f c ``Yb

⇒a `5``[Ài `Yfa]hhY`h`X]Y`GhUUhgUb k U`hgW\ UZh[Y[Yb`Y]bYb
@UbXk]fh`bUW\ `XYa `: i bX`j c b`g]YVYb`hc hY`F]bXYfb`i bX
gW\`YW\ hYb`< U`hi b[gVYX]b[i b[Yb"

⇒a `5``[Ài `gcf[h`Y]b`g_UbXU`ÒgYf`J cfZU``ZØf`5i ZfY[i b[. `5i Z`Y]bYa
6Ui Yfb\cZk i fXYb`5bZUb[`5i [i gh`g]YVYb`hc hY`F]bXYf`i bX`ØVYf
nk Ubn][`k Y]hYfY`]b`Y]bYa `gW\`YW\ hYb`Ni ghUbX`Yb hXYW`hY`H]YfY
[YZi bXYb``8]YgY`U`Ufa]YfYbXYb`9b hXYW`i b[Yb`\UVYb`b]W`h`bi f
X]Y`Òfh]W\Yb`6Y\ ÒfXYb`Ui Z`XYb`D`Ub`[Yfi ZYbž`gcbXYfb`Ui W\`X]Y
[YgUa hY`@UbXk]fhgW\ UZh[Ya`Y]bgW\ UZh]b`6UmYfb`]b`Gcf[Y
j YfgYhh`8Yf`6UmYf]gW\Y`6Ui Yfbj YfVUbX`\Uh`VYfY]hg`i a`?`Uf\Y]h
[YVYhYb`i bX`]gh`Ub`Y]bYf`gW\ bY`Yb`5i Z`Àfi b[`]bhYfYgg]Yfhž`X]Y
XUg`; YgW\Y\Yb`fi bX`i a`X]Y`F]bXYf\U`hi b[`VY`Yi W\hYb`gc``"

8]Y`ni ghÀbX][Yb`6Y\ ÒfXYbž`bUa`Yb`h]W\`XUg`@UbXfUhgUa`h
C VYfU``[Ài ž]bZcfa]YfhYb`XUfØVYfž`XUgg`X]Y`F]bXYf\U`hi b[`Ui Z
XYa`<cZ]b`XYf`J Yf[Ub[Yb\Y]h`fY[Y`a À»][`c b h f c ``Yfh`k i fXY`
HfchmXYa`k i fXYb`gY]hYbg`XYf`5i Zg]W\hgVY\ ÒfXYb`_Y]bY
[fUj]YfYbXYb`A]ggghÀbXY`ZYgh[YghY`h`8]Yg`k]fZi: fU[Yb`Ui Zž`k Y
Yg`ni `X]YgYb`_UhUghfcd\U`Yb`Ni ghÀbXYb`_ca`a`Yb`_cbbhY`i bX
k Y`W\Y`A U» bU\`a`Yb`ni`_ØbZh][`Yf[f]ZYb`k YfXYb`a`ØggYbž`i a`gc
Yhk Ug`ni`j Yf\]bXYfb``8Yf`6Ui Yfbj YfVUbX`Ài » YfhY`X]Y`9fk Ufhi b[ž
XUgg`U`Y`? c b h f c ``Yb`[fØbX`]W\`[YdfØZh`i bX`[Y[YVYbYbZU`g
bUW\`† gh]Yfh`k YfXYb`a`ØggYb"

8]Y`F c ``Y`XYf`GhUUhgUb k U`hgW\ UZh

K]Y`X]Y`G]hi Uh]cb`k Y]hYf`Yg`_U]YfYb`_ØbbhYž`nY][h`XYf`]b`; Ub[
[YgYhhY`9fa]h`i b[gdfcnYgg`XYf`GhUUhgUb k U`hgW\ UZh``Ni b`ÀW\ gh

[]h'Ygž'X]Y'[YbUi Yb' l a ghÅbXY'XYg'HcXYg'XYf'F]bXYf'ni ' _ÅfYb
i bX'k Yf'XUZØf'j YfUbhk cfh]W' [Ya UW'h'k YfXYb' _Ubb"'8]Yg
_ÖbbhY'k Y]hfY]W'YbXY': c` [Yb'ZØf'XYb'@UbXk]fh'\UVYbž'XYf'ZØf'X]Y
DZY[Y'i bX'5fh'XYf'<U'hi b['gY]bYf'H]YfY'ni ghÅbX]['gh"'5b'X]YgYf
GhY''Y'k]fX'X]Y'² ZZyb'h]W'_Y]h[YgdU'hYbž'XU'gc`W'Y]b'J cfZU''XUg
6]X'XYf'@UbXk]fhgW'UZh'ghUf'_VYY]bZi ggYb' _Ubb"'J]Y'Y'A YbgW'Yb
g]bX'Ui Z'XYf'Gi W'Y'bUW' ðZcfa Uh]cbYb'i bX'X]Y'NU\`Yb'XYf
ðhYfYgg]YfhYbž'X]Y'ØVYf'XUg'GW'W_gU'`XYf'H]YfY'6YgW'Y]X'k]ggYb
k c`Ybž'ghY][Yb"

6YgcbXYfg'fY'Yj Ubh']b'X]YgYf'i bhYfgi W'i b['k]fX'X]Y': fU[Y'gY]bž
cV'XYf'@UbXk]fh'X]Y'J cfgW'f]ZhYb'ZØf'X]Y'H]Yf\U'hi b['Y]b[Y\U'hYb
\Uh" ð'XYb''YhnhYb' ð\`fYb' [UV'Yg]a a Yf'k]YXYf'6Yf]W'hY'ØVYf
A]ggghÅbXY']b'XYf'H]Yf\U'hi b[ž'k Yg\U'V'X]Y'5i Za Yf_gUa _Y]h'XYf
² ZZyb'h]W'_Y]h'Ui Z'gc`W'Y': Å''Y'YI hfYa '\cW']gh"'9]b'gW'UfZYf
: c_i g''Y[h'ibi b'Ui W'Ui Z'XYf'J YfUbhk cfhi b['XYf'ni ghÅbX][Yb
6Y\ÖfXYž'X]Y']b'XYf'J Yf[Ub[Yb\Y]h'X]Y'?cbhfc''Yb'Xi fW' [YZØ\fh
\Uh"

<]bhYf[fØbXY'ni f'F]bXYf\U'hi b['a '5''[Åi

8]Y'F]bXYf\U'hi b['a '5''[Åi '\Uh'Y]bY''Ub[Y'HfUX]h]cbž'i bX'XYf
J Yf'i gh'j cb'H]YfYb']gh'b]W'h'bi f'Ui g'k]fhgW'UZh]W'Yf'G]W'h
VYXYb'_]W'"'6Ui Yfb']b'XYf'F Y[]cb'g]bX'Ui Z[fi bX'j cb
Ui Zk YbX][Yb'J cfgW'f]ZhYb'i bX'?cbhfc''Ybž'X]Y'ZØf'Y]bY
Ufh[YfYW'hY'H]Yf\U'hi b['[Y'hYbž'i bhYf'ghÅbX][Ya '8fi W_'8Yb'bcW
gW'Y]bh']b'X]YgYa 'gdYn]Y''Yb': U''X]Y'?cbhfc''Y'b]W'h'Ui gfY]W'YbX
[Yk YgYb'ni 'gY]bž'i a 'X]YgY'HfU[ÖX]Y'ni 'j Yf\]bXYfb"

8]Y'ni bY\`a YbXYb'6Yf]W'hY'ØVYf'_fUb_Y'i bX'gW'`YW'hj Yfgcf[hY
H]YfY'ZØ\`fYb'ni 'Y]bYa 'Xf]b[YbXYb'6YXUfZ'Ub'8]g_i gg]cbYb'ØVYf
X]Y'K]f_gUa _Y]h'XYf'VYghY\YbXYb'?cbhfc''Yb"'8]Y': cfXYfi b[Yb
bUW' ghfYb[YfYb'F Y[Y'i b[Yb'i bX'i a ZUggYbXYfYb'?cbhfc''Yb
k YfXYb''Ui hfYž'XU'g]W']a a Yf'a Y\`f'A YbgW'Yb'ZØf'XUg
K c\`Yf[Y\Yb'XYf'H]YfY'Y]bgYhYb"

K Ug'VYXYi hYh'XUg'ZØf'X]Y'Öfh]W'Yb'@UbXk]fhY'3'G]Y'gY\Yb'g]W']b
Y]bYa 'GdUbbi b[gZY'X. '5i Z'XYf'Y]bYb'GY]hY'ghY\Yb'X]Y

[YgYhn`]WXYb`5bZcfXYfi b[Ybž`X]Y`g]Y`ni`YfZØ`Yb`UVYbž`i bX`Ui Z
XYf`UbXYfYb`GY]hY`X]Y`k]fhgW`UZh`]WXYb`<YfUi`gZcfXYfi b[Ybž`X]Y
XUg`<U`hYb`j`cb`H]YfYb`a`]h`g]W`Vf]b[h``ϕ`NY]hYb`k`]Y`X]YgYb`]gh`X]Y
HfUbgdUfYbn`ØVYf`X]Y`Y][YbYb`DfU`h]_Yb`i bX`X]Y`9bHgW`Y]Xi b[
ZØf`H]Yfk`c`k`]W`h][Yf`XYbb`Yž`i a`XUg`J`YfhfUi`Yb`XYf`
J`YfVfUi`W`Yf`b]W`h`ni`j`Yf`]YfYb`"

8Yf`J`cfZU``ja`5`[`Äi`_`ÖbbhY`U`g`K`YW`fi`Z`ZØf`X]Y`[`YgUa`hY`
6fUbW`Y`X]YbYb`"9g`V`Y]Vh`UVni`k`UfhYbž`k`]Y`X]Y`9fa`]h`i`b[`Yb`g]W`
Yb`hk`]W`_Y`b`i`bX`k`Y`W`Y`9f`_Yb`hb]ggY`XUVY]`ni`hU[`Y`[`YZØfXYfh`
k`YfXYb`"8Yf`8fi`W`_Ui`Z`X]Y`J`YfUb`hk`cfh]W`Yb`k`ÄW`ghž`i`bX`U`Y`
5i`[`Yb`g]bX`[`YgdUb`bh`Ui`Z`X]Y`b`ÄW`ghYb`G`W`f]hhY`]b`X]YgYa`
VYgc`f[`b]gYffY[`YbXYb`:`U`[`Yf]W`hYh`"J`]Y`Y]W`h`k`]fX`X]Yg`Y]b`
?UhU`mgUhc`f`ZØf`h]Y`Z[`fY]ZYbXY`J`YfÄbXYfi`b[`Yb`]b`XYf`5fh`i`bX`
K`Y]gYž`k`]Y`X]Y`H]Yf`U`hi`b[`]b`6UmYfb`ØVYfXUW`h`i`bX`Ub[`YdUggh`
k`]fX`"

8]Y`6YXYi`hi`b[`j`cb`H]YfgW`i`hn`_`cb`hfc`Y`b`

8]Y`J`cfZÄ`Y`]b`C`VYfU`[`Äi`k`YfZYb`Y]b`G`W`U[`]W`h`Ui`Z`X]Y`
6YXYi`hi`b[`fY[`Y`a`Ä»][`Yf`H]YfgW`i`hn`_`cb`hfc`Y`b`]b`XYf`
@UbXk`]fhgW`UZh`"ϕ`8Yi`hgW`U`bX`g]bX`@UbXk`]fhY`[`YgYhn`]W`
j`YfdZ]W`hYhž`]\fY`H]YfY`Ufh[`YfYW`h`ni`U`hYb`"8]Yg`i`a`ZUggh`i`bhYf`
UbXYfYa`X]Y`6YfY]hghY`i`b[`j`cb`i`bhYf`_i`bZž`:`i`hhYfa`]hhY`i`bX`
K`UggYf`gck`]Y`X]Y`;`Yk`Ä`f`Y]ghi`b[`j`cb`h]YfÄfnh`]W`Yf`J`Yfgcf[`i`b[`
8]Y`_`VYfk`UW`i`b[`X]YgYf`J`cf`gW`f]ZhYb`YfZc`[`h`Xi`fW`g`hUUh`]W`Y`
GhY`Ybž`X]Y`fY[`Y`a`Ä»][`Y`ϕgdY`h]cbYb`Xi`fW`ZØ`fYb`gc`hYb`"8]Y`
?cb`hfc`Y`b`gc`Y`b`g]W`YfghY`Ybž`XUgg`H]YfY`b]W`h`j`YfbUW`Ägg][`h`
cXYf`a`]gg`UbXY`h`k`YfXYb`"

Hfchn`XYf`VYghY`YbXYb`fY[`Y`i`b[`Yb`nY][`Yb`:`Ä`Y`k`]Y`X]YgYfž`XUgg`
]b`XYf`DfUi`]g`b]W`h`ja`a`Yf`U`Yg`_`Uddh`C`Zh`k`YfXYb`A`Äb[`Y`Yfgh`
XUbb`c`ZYbg]W`h`]W`ž`k`Ybb`Yg`ni`XfUa`Uh]gW`Yb`J`cfZÄ`Yb`_ca`a`h`
8]Yg`ZØ`fh`ni`:`cfXYfi`b[`Yb`bUW`g`hfYb[`YfYb`?cb`hfc`Y`b`i`bX`a`Y`f`
HfUbgdUfYbn`]a`6YfY]W`X`Yf`H]Yf`U`hi`b[`"C`f[`Ub]gUh]cbYbž`X]Y`g]W`
ZØf`H]YfgW`i`hn`Y]bgYhnYbž`Uf[`i`a`Ybh]YfYbž`XUgg`Y]b`[`Ubn`Y]h`]W`Yf`
5bgUhn`YfZcfXYf`]W`]ghž`Y]bgW`Y]Y»`]W`d`f`Äj`Yb`h]j`Yf`A`U»`bU`a`Yb`
i`bX`VYggYfYf`5i`gV]Xi`b[`ZØf`@UbXk`]fhY`ja`6YfY]W`X`Yg`

H]YfgW\i hnYg"

2 ZZYbh`]W\Y`K U\fbY\ a i b[`i bX`F YU_h]cbYb

8]Y`9bhXYW_i b[`XYf`a]gg\UbXY`hYb`F]bXYf`\Uh]b`XYf
2 ZZYbh]W_Y]h`ZØf`5i ZgY\Yb`[Ygcf[h`J YfVfUi W\Yf`\UVYb`Y]b
k UW\gYbXYg`≠hYfYggY`XUfUbž`k]Y`H]YfY`]b`XYf`@UbXk]fhgW\UZh
VY\UbXY`h`k YfXYb`"≠a a Yf`a Y`f`A YbgW\Yb`\]bhYfZfU[Yb`X]Y
<Yf_i bZhi bX`X]Y`6YX]b[i b[Ybž`i bhYf`XYbYb`:`Y]gW\i bX
A]W\dfcXi _hY`dfcXi n]Yfh`k YfXYb`"8]YgYg`6Yk i gghgY]b`ZØ\fh`ni
Y]bYa`5bgh]Y[`XYf`B UW\ZfU[Y`bUW\`6]c!`i bX`H]Yfk c`\!G]Y[Y`bž`X]Y
ZØf`\Ø\YfY`GhUbXUfXg`]b`XYf`H]Yf\U`hi b[`ghY\Yb`"

≠`gcn]U`Yb`A YX]Yb`[UV`Yg`Yf\YV`]W\Y`F YU_h]cbYb`Ui ZX]Y
J cfZÄ`Yž`k cVY`j]Y`Y`B i hnYf`[YZcfXYfh`\UVYbž`XUgg`X]Y
J YfUbhk cfh]W\Yb`ni f`F YW\YbgW\UZh[Ync[Yb`k YfXYb`"8]YgY
9a dØfi b[`gd]Y[Y`h]g]W\`Ui W\`]b`DYh]h]cbYb`k]XYfž`X]Y`Y]bY
F YZcfa`XYf`VYghY\YbXYb`H]Yf\U`hi b[gf]W\h]b]Yb`ZcfXYfb`
H]YfgW\i hncf[Ub]gUh]cbYb`bi hnYb`gc`W\Y`9fY][b]ggY`cZhž`i a`Ui Z
A]ggghÄbXY`]a`5[fUfgY`hcf`Ui Za Yf_gUa`ni`a UW\Yb`i bX`XfÄb[Yb
Ui Z`Y[]g`Uh]j Y`J YfÄbXYfi b[Ybž`X]Y`Y]bY`VYggYfY`?cbhfc`Y`i bX
GW\i hna U»bU\`a Yb`ZØf`B i hnh]YfY`[Yk Ä`f`Y]ghYb`gc`Yb`"

F Y`Yj UbhY`GhUh]gh]_Yb`ni f`H]Yf\U`hi b[`i bX
H]YfgW\i hn

9]bY`i a ZfU[Y`XYg`A Uf_hZc fgW\i b[g]bgh]hi hg`Mci ; cj`U`h`Yf[YVYbž
XUgg`* +i`XYf`8Yi hgW\Yb`XYf`A Y]bi b[`g]bXž`XUgg`XYf`H]YfgW\i hn
]b`XYf`@UbXk]fhgW\UZh] YfVYggYfh`k YfXYb`a i gg`"8UfØVYf`\]bUi g
nY][h`Y]bY`9f\YVi b[ž`XUgg`(`) i`XYf`J YfVfUi W\Yf`VYfY]h]g]bXž
\Ø\YfY`DfY]gY`ZØf`DfcXi _hY`ni`nU\Ybž`X]Y`i bhYf`VYggYfYb
H]YfgW\i hnVYX]b[i b[Yb`\Yf[YghY`h`k i fXYb`"8]Yg`i bhYfghfY]W\hž
XUgg`XUg`6Yk i gghgY]b`ZØf`H]YfgW\i hnZfU[Yb`]b`XYf`6Yj Ø`_Yfi b[
k ÄW\ghi bX`XUgg`J YfVfUi W\Yf`Y]bY`U_h]j YfY`F c`Y`VY]`XYf
: ØfXYfi b[`j cb`h]YfZfYi bX`]W\Yb`DfU_h]_Yb`gd]Y`Yb`k c`Yb`"

Gc`W\Y`GhUh]gh]_Yb`g]bX`Yb`hgW\Y]XYbXž`i a`XYb`8fi W`_Ui ZX]Y

@UbXk]fhgWUZh'i bX'X]Y'; YgYhn[YVYf'ni 'Yf\Ø\Ybž'i a 'XYb
H]YfgWxi hn'k Y]hYf'ni 'ghÀf_Yb"'9]b'VYggYfYg'J YfghÀbXb]g'XYf
?cbgi a [Yk c\b\Y]hYb'i bX'XYf'9]bghY``i b['XYf'J YfVfUi WXYf
_ØbbhY'XUni 'VY]hfU[Ybž'XUgg'ni _ØbZh][Y'F YZcfa Yb']a 'H]YfgWxi hn
b]W'h'bi f'a Ø[`]W'ž'gcbXYfb'Ui W'bc'hk YbX]['k YfXYb"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi WXYb'G]Y'i bg'Ui Z.'b!U["XY