HØX`]WY`GW ØggY`]a` : fUb_Zi fhYf < Ui dhVU\b\cZ`9fa ]hh`i b[Yb`Ui ZYb

B UWX`hØX`]WYb`?cdZgW ØggYb`]a` : fUb\_Zi fhYf`< Ui dhVU\b\cZ`
k i fXY`Y]b`) (!Å\ f][Yf`HUhj YfXÅW h][ Yf`ZYgh[Ybca`a`Yb`"
9fa]hh`i b[ Yb`Ui ZYb`"

8 Yf` : fUb\_Zi fhYf`< Ui dhVU\b\cZ`]gh`b]W h`bi`f`Y]b`nYbhfU`Yf`
J Yf`\_Y\fg\_bchYbdi`b`h`g`cbXYfb`Ui`W`Y]b`C`fh`ž`Ub`XYa`X`Y]
G]WYf\Y]h`XYf`F`Y]gYbXYb`\ØW`ghY`Df]c]f]hÅh`\Uh`8`cW`Ua`
8]YbghU[UVYbX`\_Ua`Yg`Xcfh`ni`Y]bYa`hfU[]gWYb`J`cfZU`ž`XYf`XUg`
; YZØ`j`cb`G]WYf\Y]h`ghUf`\_`VYY]bhfÅW h][h`\Uh`8`Yf`) (!Å\ f][Y`
HUhj YfXÅW h][Yž`XYggYb`⇒Yb]hÅh`bcW`b]W`h]j`c`ghÅbX][
cZYb[Y`Y[ h`k`i`fXY`ž`ghY`h]a`J`YfXUW`hž`Y]bYb`&+!Å\ f][Yb`A`Ubb`
Xi`fW`a`Y`fYfY`[ Yn]Y`hY`GW ØggY`[YhØhY`h`ni`\UVYb`8]Y`GW ØggY`
hfUZ`Yb`XUg`C`dZYf`X]fY`_h`Ua`?`cdZž`k`Å\`fYbX`nU`\fY]WY`F`Y]gYbXY`
i`bX`DUggUb`hYb`]b`XYf`B`Å\`Y`k`UfYb`"

8]Y`6i`bXYgdc`nY]`_`cbbhY`XYb`J`YfXÅW h][Yb`\_i`fn`bUW`XYf`HUh`
ZYghbY`a`Ybž`i`bX`[ Y[ Yb`]b`k`i`fXY`<`UZhVYZ`\`k`Y[Yb`XYg`
Xf]b[YbXYb`HUhj`YfXUW`hg`XYg`A`cfXYg`Yf`UggYb`" GÅa`h]WY`
Gdi`fYb`k`YfXYb`Ui`g[ Yk`YfhYhž`NYi`[Yb`k`YfXYb`j`Yfbca`a`Yb`ž`
Yf`\_`ÅfhY`8`ca`]b]`_`A`]Ygž`GdfYWYf`XYf` : fUb\_Zi fhYf`
GhUUhgUb`k`U`hgW`UZh`8]Y`<`]bhYf[ fØbXY`XYf`HUh`g]bX`bcW`i`b`_`Uf`"
5i`W`XYf`Ni`gUa`a`Yb`Ub[ `nk`]gWYb`XYb`VY]XYb`hØf_]gWYb`
GhUUhgUb[Y\Øf][Yb`V`Y]Vh`V]g`XUhc`Y]b`F`ÅhgY`"

8]Y`9fa ]hh`i b[Yb`Ui ZYb

⇒a]hhYb`X]YgYf`VYXfc`\]WYb`@U[Y`Yb`hdi`ddYb`g]W`Ui`W`X]Y`
YfghYb`<`]bk`Y]gY`i`bX`6Yk`Y]ga ]hhY`ž`X]Y`Yg`XYb`9fa]hhYfb`
Yfa`Ø[ `]WYb`gc`Ybž`XYb`HUh\Yf[Ub[`] YbUi`ni`fY`_`cbghfi ]YfYb`"

6Yf]Wk hYb`ni Zc`[Y`\_i fg]YfYb`VYfY]hg`a i ha U»`]Wk Y`5i ZbU\ a Yb`Ui g
_ VYfk UW i b[g_Ua YfUg`ja`_hYfbYhž`X]Y`YhYb`GY`_i bXYb`j cf
XYa`\_hOX`]Wk Yb`GW i gg`nY][Yb`"5i ZX]YgYb`5i ZbU\ a Yb`]gh`ni
Yf_YbbYbž`k ]Y`XYf`HUh] YfXÅW`h][Y`g]Wk`j cb`\]bhYb`XYa`_CdZYf
bÅ\Yfhi bX`]\a`_a`]h`Y]bYf`D]ghc`Y`]bg`; Yg]Wk`h`n]Y`h`

8]Y`5i ZbU\ a Yb`k i fXYb`ni f`?Ybbhb]g`[ Ybca`_a Ybž`UVYf`k]f
k YfXYb`XUni`_Y]bY`k Y]hYfYb`?ca`\_a YbhUfY`UV[YVYb`\_ž`ZØ[hY`A]Yg
Ub`"NYi [ Yb`VYf]Wk hYhYb`Ui » YfXYa`_ž`XUgg`XYf`HÅhYf`bUW`_XYa
YfghYb`GW i gg`bcW`\_a`_]bXYghYbg`nk Y]a`_U`\_Ui ZX]Yb`VYfY]hg`Ua
6cXYb`"Y[ YbXYb`_A Ub`\_ZYi YfhY`"6i bXYgdc`n]ghYb`_cbbhY`ni a
;`ØW`_j Yf\]bXYfbž`XUgg`Yf`X]Y`GnYbY`j Yf`]Y» "

? f]a`\_]bU`dgmWk`c`c [Y`\_Ai » Yfh`gY]bY`\_6YXYb`_Yb

8]Y`i`a`\_ghÅbXY`X]YgYf`HUh`k YfZYb`j ]Y`Y`\_ : fU[ Yb`_Ui Z`
? f]a`\_]bU`dgmWk`c`c [Y`\_Fi Xc`_Z`9 [ [ Y`_f`\_Ai hYfhYž`XUgg`\_Y]bY`_gc`\_Wk`_Y`_HUh
]b`\_Y]bYa`_VY`\_VhYb`_6YfY]Wk`\_Xi fW`_Ui`\_g`_Yhk`\_Ug`_8Ya`\_cbghfU]h] Yg`_cXYf`
_hgnYb]YfhYg`\_UVYb`_ØbbhY`" » a`_UbXž`XYf`]b`\_XYf`^ ZZYbh`]Wk`_Y]h
gc`\_Wk`_Y]bY`\_HUh`VY[Y`\_hž`]gh`g]Wk`_XYg`\_c`_Yb`\_F]g]\_cg`_VYk`\_i`_gghž`
YbhXYW`\_h`ni`\_k`_YfXYb`\_ž`_a`\_Y]bh`9 [[" 8Yf`\_HÅhYf`_a`\_i`_gg`[ Yk`_i`_ggh
_UVYbž`XUgg`_Yg`\_ØVYfU`" ? Ua`\_YfUg`[]Vh`i`_bX`\_XUgg`j]Y`\_Y`_NYi [Yb
ni [Y[Yb`\_g]bX`" _B]Ya`\_UbX`_Ubb`\_g]Wk`_g]Wk`\_Yf`_gY]bž`\_cV`_Yf`\_a`_]h`gY]bYf`
HUh`i`_b[YghfUZh`XUj`_cb`\_ca`_a`\_h`

9g`]gh`i`\_b`_Ufž`\_cV`_gc`\_Wk`_Y]b`\_ ; Yk`_U`\_hU`_h`\_Ui`_g`\_Y]bYa`_`\_d`_Øh`\_]Wk`_Yb
_a`\_di`_g`\_YfUi`_g`[ YgW`_U`\_cXYf`_cV`\_h]YZfY`_6Yk`\_Y[ [ fØbXY`_]a`\_Gd]Y`
g]bX`" : Øf`_Y]bY`\_gc`_Wk`\_Y`_< UbX`\_i`_b[`a`_i`\_gg`_Yg`\_]b`_XYf`\_F`_Y[Y`\_Y`_]b`\_ghUf`_Yg
A`\_ch]j`_ [YVYbž`\_cXYf`_XYf`\_HÅhYf`_ghUbX`\_i`_bhYf`[ fc» Ya`_`\_8fi`_W`\_ž`_`_gU[hY
9 [[" 8YfnY]h`\_V`_Y]Vh`\_XYb`_9fa`\_]h`_Yfb`\_bi`_fž`\_U`_Y`\_A`_Ø[`]Wk`_Y]hYb`_ni
dfØZYb`\_i`_bX`\_GdY`_i`\_Uh]cbYb`_ØVYf`\_X]Y`_<]bhYf[fØbXY`\_XYf`_HUh
Ubni`\_ghY`_Yb`"

I`\_a`_X]Y`\_G]Wk`_Yf`\_Y]h`_Ua`\_`_6U`\_b`_c`\_Z`_ni`\_Yf`_Ø`\_Ybž`[]h`\_gY]h`_XYa`\_`_%`\_`_ž`_b]
Y]b`\_bÅW`_h]Wk`\_Yg`_K`\_UZZYbj`_YfV`\_chž`_XUg`\_Yg`_j`\_YfV]YhYhž`_]b`\_XYf`_nk`\_]gW`_Yb
&\$`"\$`_i`\_f`_i`\_bX`_) "\$`\_i`_f`\_k`_UZZYb`\_cXYf`_A`\_YggYf`_a`\_]h`_Y]bYf`\_@Åb[ Y`_j`_cb
a`\_Y`_f`\_U`_g`\_j`_]Yf`\_NYbh]a`_YhYfb`\_a`_]h`\_ni`_ZØ`\_fYb`"

9fa]hh'i b[Yb`]a `; Ub[Y

8]Y`6fi hU`]hÅh`X]YgYf`HUh`\\Uh`b]W`h`bi f`XYb`<Ui dhVU\\b`\\cZ`]b`XYb
: c_i g[YfØW`hž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`X]Y`5i Za Yf\_gUa \_Y]h`Ui Z`X]Y
G]W`Yf\\Y]hg`U[Y`Ub`ÖZZYbh`]W`Yb`C fhYb`[Y`Yb`h`"8]Y`Dc`]nY`]i bX
GhUUhgUbK U`hgW`UZh`g]bX`]bhYbg]j`VYa Ø`hž`U`Y`6Yk`Y]ga]hhY`ni
g]W`Yfb`i bX`?`Uf\\Y]h`ØVYf`XYb`<Yf[ Ub[ `XYg`J YfVfYW`Ybg`ni
VY_ca a Yb"

8i fW`X]Y`; YgW`Y\\b]ggY`]b`: fUb\_Zi fh`k]fX`X]Y`8]g_i gg]cb`i a
G]W`Yf\\Y]h`Ub`ÖZZYbh`]W`Yb`C fhYb`bYi`YbhZUW`h`"5`Y`5i [Yb`g]bX
bi b`Ui Z`X]Y`9fa ]hh'i b[ gVY\\ØfXYb`[Yf]W`hYhž`XU`g]Y`X]Y
_ca d`Yi Yb`: fU[Yb`i a`XYb`<]bhYf[ fi bX`i bX`X]Y`A YW`Ub]ga Yb
gc`W`Yf`; Yk U`hhUhYb`\_`ÅfYb`a`ØggYb`"8]Yg`g]bX`YbhgW`Y]XYbXY
GW`f]hhYž`i a`XUg`J YfhfUi Yb`XYf`^2`ZZYbh`]W`\_Y]h`]b`X]Y
G]W`Yf\\Y]hga U» bU`a Yb`k ]YXYf\\Yfni ghY`Yb`i bX`Å`b`]W`Y`J cfZÅ`Y
]b`XYf`Ni _i bZh`ni`j Yf\\]bXYfb"

F YU_h]cbYb`Ui Z`X]Y`HUh

8]Y`hØX`]W`Yb`GW`ØggY`]a`: fUb\_Zi fhYf`<Ui dhVU\\b`\\cZ`\\UVYb
ÖZZYbh`]W`Y`i bX`dc`]h]gW`Y`F YU\_h]cbYb`Ui g[Y`Øgh`"J]Y`Y`6Øf[Yf
g]bX`gW`cW_]Yfh`ØVYf`X]Y`6fi hU`]hÅh`X]Yf`HUh`Ub`Y]bYa`ÖZZYbh`]W`
ni [Åb[`]W`Yb`C fh`"Æ`gcn]U`Yb`A YX]Yb`k]fX`X]Y`: cfXYfi b[`bUW`
a Y`f`G]W`Yf\\Y]hga U» bU`a Yb`]b`6U`b`\\ÖZYb`i bX`ÖZZYbh`]W`Yb
J Yf_Y`fga ]hhY`b`"Ui h`G]W`Yf\\Y]hgj`cf_Y`\\fi b[ Yb`]b`VYgcbXYfg
ghUf`\_ZfYe`i Ybh]YfhYb`6YfY]W`Yb`k YfXYb`gY]h`Å`fYb`]bhYbg]j
X]g_i h]Yfhž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`]a`<]bV`]W`\_Ui Z`XUg`k UW`gYbXY
G]W`Yf\\Y]hgVYXØfZb]g`XYf`6Yj`Ö`_Yfi b["

Dc`]h]gW`Y`J YfhfYhYf`\\UVYb`YVYbZU`g`Ui Z`X]Y`9fY][ b]ggY`fYU[]Yfh`
ÆbYba]b]ghYf]Yb`Ui Z`@UbXYg!`i bX`6i bXYgYVYbY`a`ØggYb`g]W`
bi b`a`]h`XYf`: fU[Y`Ui gY]bUbXYfgYhnYbž`k]Y`gc`W`Y`HUhYb`]b
Ni _i bZh`j Yf\\]bXYfh`k YfXYb`\_ÖbbYb`"ÆgVYgcbXYfY`X]Y
5i gk`Y]hi b[ `j`cb`J]XYcØVYfk UW`i b[ ggmghYa Yb`i bX`X]Y`DfÅgYbn
j`cb`G]W`Yf\\Y]hg`fÅZhYb`]b`6U`b`\\ÖZYb`ghY`\\Yb`]a`: c_i g`XYf
8YVUhhYb`"Æ`XYf`J Yf[ Ub[ Yb`\\Y]h`\\UVYb`Å`b`]W`Y`J cfZÅ`Y`]a`a`Yf
k]YXYf`G]W`Yf\\Y]hgZfU[Yb`Ui Z[ Yk cfZYbž`YXcW`V`Y]VYb`j ]Y`Y

?cbnYdhY'i bX' ð]h]Uh]j Yb'cZh'k]f_i b[g`cg"

G]W\ Yf\ Y]h'Ua ' : fUb_Zi fhYf' < Ui dhVU\ b\ cZ

8Yf': fUb_Zi fhYf' < Ui dhVU\ b\ cZ]gh'Y]bYf'XYf'j Yf_Y\fgfY]W ghYb
6U\ b\ ÖZ']b'9i fcdU" HÄ[']W' bi hnYb' A]']cbYb'j cb'FY]gYbXYb'i bX
DUggUbhYb'X]Y'5b`U[Yž'X]Y'Y]b'k]W'h][Yg'J Yf_Y\fgXfY\ _fyi n
XUfghY`h"8]Y'G]W\ Yf\ Y]hg`U[Y']b'6U\ b\ ÖZ'b'k]fX'fY[Y'a Ä»][
UbU`mg]Yfhž'i bX'gY]h'XYb'J cf\_ca a b]ggYb'XYf'`YhnYb' ð\ fY\ UVYb
X]Y'G]W\ Yf\ Y]hgVY\ ÖfXYb'j YfghÄf_h'A U» bU\ a Yb'ni f'DfÄj Ybh]cb
j cb'; Yk U'hj YfvfYW\ Yb']a d`Ya Ybh]Yfh"

I a `XUg'G]W\ Yf\ Y]hgb]j YUi `ni ` \YVYbž'k i fXYb' bYVYb'XYf
j YfghÄf_hYb'J]XYcØVYfk UW\ i b[`Ui W\ GW\ i `i b[Yb'ZØf
6U\ b\ cZgdYfgcbU`gck ]Y'X]Y'9]bZØ\ fi b[ `ni gÄh`]W\ Yf
G]W\ Yf\ Y]hg_fÄZh']b'XYb'5VYbXghi bXYb'Ub[YgdfcW\ Yb"8Ug
bÄW\ h']W\ Y'K UZZYbj Yfvchž'XUg'gY]h'XYa `%" ð b] []hž']gh'Y]bY
k Y]hYfY'A U» bU\ a Yž'i a `X]Y'G]W\ Yf\ Y]h'ni `Yf\ Ö\ Yb'i bX', VYf[f]ZZY
ni `j Yf\]bXYfb"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W\ Yb'G]Y' i bg'Ui Z. 'b!U["XY