

GWÅ`Yi g]b[Yb. 'HfU[]gWÅ Yf': i bX`]a '6UWÅ`
Dc`]nY]'Yfa]hhY`h']a ': U``Y]bYg
, \$! Æ\ f][Yb

DUggUbhYb`YbhXYW_Yb`Y]bYb`hc hYb`A Ubb`]b`Y]bYa`'6UWÅ`]b
GWÅ`Yi g]b[Yb"8]Y`Dc`]nY]'Yfa]hhY`h`/Gi`]n]X`Ui`g[YgWÅ`cggYb"

9]b`hfU[]gWÅ Yf`J cfZU``YfgWÅ ØhhYfhY`Ua`'A cbhU[a`cf[Yb`X]Y`GhUXh
GWÅ`Yi g]b[Yb`]a`'@UbX_fY]g`<`]XVi`f[\Ui`gYbž`U`g`GdUn]Yf[Åb[Yf
VY]'Y]bYa`'BUhi`fUi`gZi`['Ui`Z`Y]bYb`@Y]WÅ`bUa`'gh]Y» Yb"8]YgYf
gWÅ`fYW_]WÅ`Y': i bX`\Uh`b]WÅ`h`bi`f`X]Y`5bk`YgYbXYb`gWÅ`cW_]Yfhž
gcbXYfb`Ui`WÅ`X]Y`Dc`]nY]'XUni`'j`YfUb`Ugghž`Y]bY`i`a`ZUggYbXY
9fa`]hh`i`b[`Y]bni`'Y]hYb"

8]Y`gWÅ`cW_]YfhYb`DUggUbhYb`YbhXYW_hYb`XYb`@Y]WÅ`bUa`'Y]bYg
a`Åbb`]WÅ`Yb`'bX]j`]Xi`i`a`g`]b`Y]bYa`'6UWÅ`Ui`Z`XYf`'bi`f`Yhk`U`XfY]»][
NYbh]a`Y`hYf`h]YZ`k`Uf"8]Yg`[YgWÅ`U`]b`XYf`'B`Å`Y`XYf':]gWÅ`VUWÅ`Yf
GhfU» Yž`Y]bYa`'C`fhž`XYf`'bc`fa`U`Yfk`Y]gY`Y]b`j`cb`XYf`'BUhi`f
i`a`[YVYbYb`'C`fh`XYf`'Fi` \Y`]gh"8]Y`Dc`]nY]]b`gdY`_h]cb`Gi` \`k`i`fXY
gWÅ`bY``ni`f`l`bZU``ghY``Y`[Yfi`ZYb"

⇒XYbh]hÅ`h`XYg`'J`Yfghc`fVYbYb`'i`bX
9fa`]hh`i`b[Yb

8]Y`9fa`]hh`i`b[Yb`g]bX`]bnk`]gWÅ`Yb`]b`j`c``Ya`'; Ub[Yž`i`bX`'Ui`h
Y]bYf`GdfYWÅ`Yf]b`XYf`'Dc`]nY]'k`i`fXY`X]Y`⇒XYbh]hÅ`h`XYg
j`Yfghc`fVYbYb`'A`Ubb`Yg`VYfY]hg`[Y`_`Å`fh"9g` \UbXY`h`g]WÅ`'i`a`'Y]bYb
, \$! Æ\ f][Ybž`XYggYb`'BYbbi`b[`bcWÅ`'Ui`gghY` \h"8]Y`[YbUi`Yb
l`a`gh`Å`bXY`gY]bYg`HcXYg`g]bX`'YXcWÅ`'bcWÅ`'i`b`_`Ufž`i`bX`X]Y`Dc`]nY]
_Ubb`V]g\Yf`_Y]bY`YbX[Ø`h][Yb`5i`ggU[Yb`ni`f`HcXYgi`fgUWÅ`Y
a`UWÅ`Yb"

B UWX`XYb`YfghYb`ϕZcfa Uh]cbYb`XYi hYh`b]W\hg`XUfUi Z`\]bž`XUgg`Yg
g]W\`i a`Y]bYb`Gi]n]X`\UbXY`hž`k Ug`ni a`]bXYgh`Y]bYb`_`Y]bYb
@]W\hV`]W_`]b`X]YgYf`hfU[]gW\Yb`G]hi Uh]cb`XUfghY``h"8]Y
?f]a`]bU`dc`]nY]`Gi \`VYa Ø\`h]g]W`]bhYbg]j ž`U`Y`fY`Yj UbhYb
<]bk Y]gY`ni`gUa`a`Y`b`i`bX`X]Y`[YbUi Yb`l`a`ghÅbXY`gY]bYg`HcXYg
ni`_`ÅfYb"

8]Y`Ya`ch]cbU`Y`6Y`Ughi b[`ZØf`X]Y`DUggUbhYb`a`i`gg`Ybcfa
[Yk YgYb`gY]b" `a`A`ca`YbhXYg`9bhXYW`Ybg`Y]bYg`@]W\bUa`g`g]bX
j]Y`Y`:`fU[Yb`]a`?`cdZXYf`A`YbgW\Ybž`X]Y`NYi [Yb`X]YgYf
Z`fW\hVUfYb`GnYbYf]Y`k`i`fXYb"l`a`XYb`6YXØfZb]ggYb`XYf
HfUi YfbXYb`FYW\bi b[`ni`hfU[Ybž`k`]fX`Ui W\`X]Y`dgmW\c`c[]gW\Y
l`bhYfghØhni b[`ZØf`X]Y`DUggUbhYb`]b`6YhfUW\h`[Ync[Yb"

9]b[Y\YbXY`9fa`]hh`i`b[Yb`]b`Y]bYa`gc`b`gh
fi`\][Yb`]; YV]Yh

8]Y`FY[]cb`i`a`GW\`Yi`g]b[Yb`]gh`VY`_`Ubbh`ZØf`]fY`a`U`Yf]gW\Yb
@UbXgW\UZhYb`i`bX`X]Y`fi`\][Y`B`Uhi`f"9]b`gc`W\Yg`J`cfZU``]gh]b
X]YgYf`Zf]YX`]W\Yb`l`a`[YVi`b[`Åi`»`Yfgh`gY`hYbž`k`Ug`X]Y
GW\c`W`k`Y`Y`ž`X]Y`Xi`fW\`X]Y`;`Ya`Y]bXY`[Y\`hž`bcW\`j`YfghÅf`_`h"8]Y
Dc`]nY]`\Uh`Ub[Y`_`ØbX][`hž`gck`c`\`X]Y`l`a`[YVi`b[`U`g`Ui`W\`
a`Ø[`]W\Y`NYi [Yb`[`fØbX`]W\`ni`VYZfU[Ybž`i`a`XYb`:`U``gc`gW\bY``
k]Y`a`Ø[`]W\`ni`_`ØgYb"

8]Y`HfU[]_`X]YgYf`G]hi Uh]cb`k`]fZhj`]Y`Y`:`fU[Yb`Ui`Z`K`]Y`_`c`bbhY`Yg
XUni`_`ca`a`Ybž`XUgg`Y]b`,`\$!`Å\`f][Yf`A`Ubb`]b`Y]bYa`6UW\`
[YZ`bXYb`k`]fX`3`K`Ug`_`Øb`bhY`]a`k`]XYfZU`fYb`gY]b`3`8]Y
l`a`ghÅbXY`YfZcfXYfb`Y]bY`h]YZ[Y\YbXY`l`bhYfgi`W\i`b[ž`i`a
5bhk`cfhYb`ni`Z]bXYb" `Gc`W\Y`J`cfZÅ`Y`ZcfXYfb`b]W\hibi`f`X]Y
9fa`]hh`i`b[gVY\`ØfXYbž`g]Y`UggYb`Ui`W\`VY]`XYf`²`ZZYbh`]W\`_`Y]h
:`fU[Yb`c`ZZYbž`X]Y`gW\k`Yf`ni`VYUbhk`cfhYb`g]bX"

ϕ`XYb`_`ca`a`YbXYb`HU[Yb`k`]fX`X]Y`Dc`]nY]`k`Y]hYf`Ub`X]YgYa`:`U``
UfVY]hYb"8]Y`5bk`c`b`Yf`g]bX`Ui`Z[Yfi`ZYbž`ϕZcfa`Uh]cbYb
VYfY]hni`ghY`Ybž`X]Y`ni`f`5i`Z`_`Åfi`b[`XYg`:`U`g`VY]hfU[Yb`_`Øb`bhYb"
8]YgY`hfU[]gW\Y`9bhXYW`i`b[`_`Ubb`X]Y`A`YbgW\Yb`]b`GW\`Yi`g]b[Yb
i`bX`XUfØVYf`\]bUi`g`b]W\h`_`U`h`UggYbž`i`bX`X]Y`Dfc`nYggYž`X]Y

Zc`[Yb`a ØggYbž`i a `X]Yg`ni ` _`ÄfYbž`g]bX`j cb`[fc»Yf`6YXYi hi b[
ZØf`X]Y`[YgUa hY`FY[]cb"

9]b`j YfghØfYbXYf` : i bX`i bX`gY]bY
? cbgYe i YbnYb

5`g`DUggUbhYb`X]YgYb`gW`fYW`_]W`Yb` : i bX`a UW`hYbž`ghUbXYb`g]Y
j cf`Y]bYf`gW`a Yfn`UZhYb`FYU`]hÄhž`X]Y`g]Y`k U`fgW`Y]b`]W`b]Y
j Yf[YggYb`k YfXYb`"K Ä`fYbX`X]Y`9fa]h`i b[Yb`j cfUb`gW`fY]hYbž
V`Y]Vh`XYf`J cfZU`Y]b`_`UfYf`6Yk Y]g`XUZØfž`XUgg`XUg`@YVYb
a UbW`a U`i bYfk UfhYhY`i bX`hfU[]gW`Y`K YbXi b[Yb`b]a a hž`gY`Vgh
]b`XYb`Zf]YX`]W`ghYb`9W`Yb`i bgYfYf`K Y`h"

8]Y`Dc`]nY`]`Uh`VYhc`bhž`XUgg`YXY`≠Zcfa Uh]cbž`X]Y`ni f`5i Z`Äfi b[
XYg` : U`g`VY]hfU[Yb`_`ØbbhYž`j cb`Ybh`gW`Y]XYbXYf`6YXYi hi b[`]gh"
9g`V`Y]Vh`ni `cZZYbž`XUgg`gW`bY`@]W`h`]bg`8i b`_Y`_`ca a hi bX`X]Y
5b[Y`Øf][Yb` ; Yk]gg`Y]h`Yf`U`hYbž`k Ug`ni `Y]bYa`gc`W`Yb`i b[`ØW`
[YZØ`fh`\UVYb`_`ØbbhY"

8 YhU]`g`ni a `< cW`gW`i `!`i bX`Gcn]U`i a ZY`X`]b
H\Øf]b[Yb

H\Øf]b[Ybž`Y]b`6i bXYg`UbX`]a `< YfnYb`8Yi hgW`UbXgž`\Uh`Y]bY
`Ub[Y`i bX`_ca d`Yi Y` ; YgW`]W`hYž`X]Y`k]YXYfi a `5i gk]f`_i b[Yb
Ui ZXUg`gc]U`Y`i bX`k]fhgW`UZh`]W`Y`i a ZY`X`XYf`FY[]cb`\Uh`BUW`
XYa ` : U`XYf`A Ui Yf`%- , - `Yf`YVhY`H\Øf]b[Yb`Y]bYb`h]YZ[fY]ZYbXYb
K UbXY`j cb`Y]bYf`gc]U`]gh]gW`Yb`D`UbK]fhgW`UZh`\]b`ni `Y]bYf
a Uf`_hk]fhgW`UZh`]W`Yb`Ghfi `_hi f`"8]Yg`\Uh`X]Y`@YVYbgei U`]hÄh`XYf
9]bk c`bYf`gck c`\`dcg]h]j `U`g`Ui W`bY[Uh]j `VY]bZi gghž`a]h`Y]bYf
Ni bU`a Y`j cb`K]fhgW`UZh]b]h]Uh]j Ybž`UVYf`Ui W`a]h
< YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb`]b`6Yni [`Ui Z5fVY]hgd`ÄhY`i bX`gc]U`Y
G]W`Yf`Y]h"

≠bgVYgcbXYfY`X]Y`Ä`hYfYb` ; YbYfUh]cbYbž`ni `XYbYb`Ui W`X`Yf
j YfghcfVYbY` , \$!`Ä`\f][Y`[Y`ØfYb`_`ØbbhYž`\UVYb`cZi`a]h`XYb
 : c`[Yb`X]YgYf`J YfÄbXYfi b[Yb`ni `Äa dZYb`"J]Y`Y`GYb]cfYb`ghY`Yb
j cf`XYf`< YfUi gZcfXYfi b[`XYg`gc]U`Yb`K UbXY`gž`XYf`cZi`Y]b

; YZØ\`XYf'gcb'ah]g]WVf]b[h'`b`ÅbX`WYb`FY[]cbYb`k]Y
<]XVi f[\Ui gYb`]ghXUg`[YgY`gWUZh]WY`9b[U[Ya YbhZØf`A`hYfY
A YbgWYb`VYgcbXYfg`k]W h][ži a `9]bgUa _Y]h'ni `VY_Åa dZYb"

DgmW]gWY ; Ygi bX\Y]h'i bX

I bhYfghØhni b[ggmghYa Y

8 Ug`H\Ya U`dgmW]gWY ; Ygi bX\Y]h`ghj cb`[fc»Yf`6YXYi hi b[]b
8 Yi hgW`UbXž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`]b`XYb`YhYb`»\fYbž`]b`XYbYb
]a a Yf`a Y\`f`A YbgWYb`j cb`dgmW]gWYb`9f`fUb`i b[Yb`VYhfcZZYb
g]bX`cXYf`i bhYf`XYa `8fi W`UbXYfYf`@VYbgi a ghÅbXY`Y]XYb`" `b
H\Øf]b[Ybž`k c`Y]b`Yf\YV`]WYf`HY`]`XYf`6Yj Ø`_Yfi b[`A`hYf`]ghž
gd]Y`hX]Y`dgmW`cgc]U`Y`I`bhYfghØhni b[`Y]bY`nYbhfU`Y`F`c`Y"

J YfgW]YXYb`Y`C f[Ub]gUh]cbYb`UfVY]hYb`XUfUbž`5b[YVchY`ni f
J YfVYggYfi b[`XYf`dgmW]gWYb` ; Ygi bX\Y]h'ni `gW UZYbž`XcW
[]Vh`Yg`]a a Yf`bcW`<]bXYfb]ggY`ZØf`j]Y`Y`6YhfcZZYbYž`X]YgY`<`]ZYb
]b`5bgdfi W`ni `bY`a Yb`"8]Y`I`fgUWYb`ZØf`gc`WY`Ni ghÅbXY`g]bX
j]Y`Z`h][`i bX`_ØbbYb`j cb`dYfgØb`]WYb`J Yf`i ghYb`V]g`\]b`ni
`Ub[Ub`U`hYbXYa `GhfYgg`Ui gfY]WYb"

I a `Ui ZX]Y`Bchk YbX][_Y]h`Y]bYg`j YfghÅf`hYb` : c`i`g`Ui Z
dfÅj Ybh]j Y`A U»bU`a Yb`\]bni k Y]gYbž`VYhcbYb`9I dYfhYb`X]Y
K]W h][_Y]h`j cb` ; Ya Y]bgWUZhg]b]h]Uh]j Yb`i bX`XYf`GW UZI b[`j cb
F Åi a Ybž`]b`XYbYb`g]W`A YbgWYb`VY[Y[bYb`i bX`Ui ghUi gWYb
_ØbbYb`"6YgcbXYfY`5i Za Yf`gUa _Y]h[]`hXUVY]`XYf`I`bhYfghØhni b[
j cb`GYb]cfYbž`X]Y`cZh`k Yb][`gc]U`Y`?cbhU`hY`\UVYb"

: Øf`k Y]hYfY`»Zcfa Uh]cbYb`ni `I`bhYfghØhni b[gUb[YVchYb`ni f
dgmW]gWYb` ; Ygi bX\Y]h]b`H\Øf]b[Yb`_Ubb`X]Y`K YVgY]hY`XYg
H\Øf]b[Yf`A]b]ghYf]i a g`ZØf`5fVY]hž`Gcn]U`Ygž` ; Ygi bX\Y]hž` : fUi Yb
i bX` : Ua]`Y`VYgi W`h`k YfXYb`"8cfh`g]bX`nU`\fY]WY`Dfc[fUa a Y
i bX`<`]ZgUb[YVchY`Ui Z[YZØ`fhž`X]Y`gdYn]Y`U`i ZX]Y`6YXØfZb]ggY
XYf`FY[]cb`ni [YgW`b]hhYb`g]bX"

6Ygi W\Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`b!U["XY