

? UghUb]Yb ``Y]XYb`i bhYf`A]b]Yfa chhYb. 9]b`< YfVgh`c \ bY`6`ÀhhYf3

A]b]Yfa chhYb`VYZÀ``Yb`? UghUb]Yb`i bX`j Yfi fgUWXYb
ZfØ\ nY]h][Yb`6`UhhZU``''9I dYfhYb`k UfbYb`j cf`: c`[Yb`j cb
HfcW_Yb\Y]hi bX`?`]a Uk UbXY``

8]Y`[c`XYbYb`A cbUhY`XYg`< YfVghYg`g]bX`bcW`]b`k Y]hYf`: YfbYž
XcW`j]Y`Y`F cgg_UghUb]Yb`\UVYb`VYfY]hg`X]Y`YfghYb`6`ÀhhYf
UV[Yk cfZYb`i bX`nY][Yb`g]W`]b`j Yf`Yhn`]W`Ya`Ni ghUbX``; fi bX
XUZØf`]gh`b]W`h`bi f`XYf`Zc fhgW`fY]hYbXY`?`]a Uk UbXY`ž`gcbXYfb`Y]b
_`Y]bYgž`UVYf`[YZfÀ»][Yg`ϕgY`_h`X]Y`? UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa chhY``K]Y
9I dYfhYb`VYf]W`hYbž`]gh`XYf`6YZU``]b`X]YgYa`ϕ\`f`VYgcbXYfg`ghUf_
Ui g[YdfÀ[h`C`UZ`N]a a Yfa Ubbž`ϕgY`_hYb`_i bX`Yf`Ua
@UbXk]fhgW`UZh`]W`Yb`HYW`bc`c[]YnYbhf`i a`5i [i ghYbVYf[]b
?Uf`gf`i \Yž`g]Y\`h`X]Y`5i gk]f`_i b[Yb`U`g`U`Ufa]YfYbX`Ub``6YfY]hg`]b
XYb`Gca a Yfa cbUhYb`k UfYb`X]Y`k Y]»V`Øh][Yb`F cgg_UghUb]Yb`]b
DUf_gž`5``Y`Yb`i bX`; ÀfhYb`j]Y`Yfcfhg`bU\Yni`V`Uhh`cg"

K]Y`F c`UbX`A Ø\`Yh\U`Yf`j ca`B`Uhi fgW`i hnVi bX`FB`UVi Ł`Yf`Ài hYfhž
nY][h`g]W`XUg`DfcV`Ya`VYfY]hg`]b`XYf`nk Y]hYb`5i [i gh\`À`ZhY.`X]Y
J YfZÀfVi b[`i bX`XUg`5VZU``Yb`XYf`6`ÀhhYf`g]bX`hmd]gW`Y
ϕX]_Uhc`fYb`ZØf`Y]bYb`ghUf`_Yb`6YZU``ž`XYf`Xi fW`X`Yb`?`]a Uk UbXY`
i bX`X]Y`j YfVi bXYbYb`Yi hfYa Yb`K YhhYfVYX]b[i b[Yb`j YfghÀf`_h
k]fX``8]Y`6`Ài a Yž`X]Y`j cf`U``Ya`Xi fW`HfcW_Yb\Y]h`Y]XYbž`g]bX
b]W`h`bi f`k Yb][Yf`fcVi ghž`gcbXYfb`n]Y\Yb`Ui W`GW`ÀX`]b[Y`Ub`
6YgcbXYfg]a`BcfXcghYb`8Yi hgW`UbXg`\UVYb`X]Y`6`Ài a Y`i bhYf
ϕ\`fY`Ub[Yf`HfcW_Yb\Y]h`ni ``Y]XYbž`k Ug`Ui W`nU\`fY]W`Y
5VghYfVYZÀ``Y`ni f`: c`[Y`\UhhY"

8]Y`F c``Y`XYf`HfcW_Yb\Y]h

@Ui h'A Ø\`Yh\U`Yf'g]bX`X]Y`F cgg_UghUb]Yb`VYgcbXYfg'UbZÀ``][`ZØf
GWÅX`]b[Yžk Ybb'g]Y`i bhYf'GhfYgg'Xi fW\`Ub\U`hYbXY`HfcW_Yb\Y]h
`Y]XYb"8]Yg'gh]b`XYb`YhnhYb`š\`fYb`Y]b`ni bY\`a YbXYg'DfcV`Ya
[Yk cfXYb"8]Y`F cgg_UghUb]Y`ghUa a h'i fgdfØb[`]W\`Ui g`XYa
A]hhY`a YYffUi a `i bX`VYbØh][h'Ui gfY]W\YbX`Yi W\h][`_Y]hž`i a
[Ygi bX`ni `V`Y]VYb"J Yf_bØdZ`h'a]hY]bYa `ghUf_Yb
GWÅX`]b[gVYZU``_Ubb`HfcW_Yb\Y]h`Ub[Zf]gh][`ni `Y]bYa
5VghYfVYb`XYf'6Åi a Y`ZØ\`fYb"8]Yg`_ØbbhY`VYXYi hYbž`XUgg`]b
bU\`Yf`Ni _i bZ`UbXYfY`6Ui a UfhYb`X]Y`D`ÅhY`XYf`_fÅb`_]W\Yb
F cgg_UghUb]Yb`Y]bbY\`a Yb`a ØggYb"8 Ug`J YfgW\k]bXYb`X]YgYf
[YV]YhgZfYa XYb`5fh'ghY`h`ZØf`X]Y`\Y]a]gW\Y`:`cfU`b]W\h'i bVYX]b[h
Y]bYb`J Yf`i gh`XUfž`XU`\Y]a]gW\Y`6Ui a UfhYb`VYj cfni [h'k YfXYb
gc`hYb"

8]Y`? UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa c`hhY`f7Ua YfUf]U`c`\f]XY`UŁ`]gh`Y]b`_`Y]bYgž
Yhk U`ZØbZ`A]`]a YhYf`[fc» Yg`đgY`_hž`XUg`gY]bY`9]Yf`Ui Z`XYf
C VYfgY]hY`XYf`? UghUb]YbV`ÅhYf`UV`Y[h`B UW\`Y]bYf`F`Y]Zi b[gnY]h
j cb`fi bX`XfY]`K cW\Yb`gW\`ØdZYb`X]Y`@Ufj Ybž`X]Y`g]W\`XUbb`Xi fW\
XUg`6`Uh]bbYfY`ZfYggYb"8]Yg`ZØ\`fh`XUni ž`XUgg`X]Y`VYhfc`ZYbYb
6`ÅhYf`gW\`bY`k`Y`_Yb"8 U`X]Yg`X]Y`D\`c`hc`gmb`h\YgY`XYf`6Åi a Y
Yf\`YV`]W\`VYY]bhfÅW\h][hž`g]bX`g]Y`Xi fW\`J Yfa]bXYfi b[`XYf
B U\`fi b[gni Z` \f`UbZÀ``][Yf`ZØf`UbXYfY`GhfYggZU`_hc`fYb"

9ZZY`_h]j Y`A U» bU\`a Yb`[Y[Yb`XYb`6YZU``

<`]ZfY]W\Y`A U» bU\`a Yb`[Y[Yb`X]Y`? UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa c`hhY`g]bX
i b_ca`d`]n]Yfh`8 Ug`gcf[ZÀ`h][Y`9]bgUa a Y`b`i bX`9bhgc f[Yb`XYf
UV[YZU``YbYb`6`ÅhYf`hfÅ[h`XUni `VY]ž`X]Y`@Ufj Yb`ni `YbhzYfbYb"
8Ybb`Ui g`X]YgYb`,`VYfV`Y]VgY`b`_ØbbhYb`VU`X`bYi Y`A c`hhYb
gW\`ØdZYbž`X]Y`XYb`6Åi a Yb`k`Y]hYf`ni gYhnhYb"6YgcbXYfg
VYhfc`ZYb`g]bX`bi f`X]Y`k`Y]» V`Ø\`YbXYb`F cgg_UghUb]Yb`f5YgW`i g
\]ddcWUghUbi a ł`ž`k`Å\`fYbX`fchV`Ø\`YbXY`5fhYb`f5YgW`i g`WUfbYUŁ
b]W\h'i bhYf`XYa`6YZU```Y]XYb"8]Yg`ghY`h`Y]bY`dcg]h]j Y`9f`_Ybbhb]g
XUfž`X]Y`;`Åf`hbYf`i bX`DUf`_j Yfk U`hi b[Yb`]b`XYf`DZY[Y`XYf`6Åi a Y
VYfØW_g]W\h][Yb`_ØbbYb"

8]Y`F cgg_UghUb]Y`YfZfYi h'g]W\`gY]h`XYa`%+`"š\`f\`i bXYfh]b`9i fcdU
[fc» Yf`6Y`]YVh\Y]h'k`Y[Yb`]fYf`gW\`ØbYb`6`ØhYb`i bX`6`ÅhYf"8 cW\

gY]h'XYa 'd\af%- , - \Uh'X]Y'A]b]Yfa chhY'gi _nYgg]j Y'9i fcdU
YfcVYfh'i bX'j Yfi bg]W\Yfh'gca]h'ini bY\ a YbX'6Ui a `]YV\UVYf'i bX
X]Y'I a k Y'h'I fgd f0b[`]W\ZUbX'X]Y'5i gVfY]hi b[`XYf'A chhY
k U\fgW\Y]b`]W\`fYb'I fgd fi b[`]b'gW\k Yf'ni [`Ab[`]W\Yb
GW`i W\hYb'XYg'6U`_Ubg"

8]Y `Ni _i b Zh'XYf`F c gg_UghUb]Y b

8]Y `Ub\U`hYbXYb'I a k Y'h] Yf`AbXYfi b[Yb'i bX'X]Y'6YXfc\i b[
Xi fW`X]Y`?UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa chhY'k YfZYb`Y]b`@]W\h'Ui ZX]Y
Bchk YbX][_Y]h'z'g]W`]bhYbg]j `a]h'XYf`J YfUbhk cfhi b[`Z0f'i bgYfY
\Y]a]gW\Yb'6Ui a UfhYb'Ui gY]bUbXYfni gYhmYb"8Yf`GW\i hn'XYf
\Y]a]gW\Yb':`cfUi bX': Ui bU'gc`hY'b]W\h'bi f'ja `hYfYggY`XYf
B Uhi f'gY`Vgh'z'gcbXYfb'Ui W`Z0f'bUW\Zc`[YbXY'; YbYfUh]cbYb'gY]b"
6Ui a UfhYb'z'X]Y`fcVi gh'g]bX'i bX'VYggYf'a]h'XYb`J Yf`AbXYfi b[Yb
XYg'?`ja Ug'i a [Y\Yb`_0bbYb'z'_0bbhYb'gW\cb`VU`X`]b'i bgYfYb
DUf_g'i bX'; `AfhYb'ni `Z]bXYb'gY]b'z'k `A\YfYbX'X]Y`F cgg_UghUb]Yb`VY]
Ub\U`hYbXYb'DfcV`Ya Yb'ni bY\ a YbX`]b'XYb`<]bhYf[fi bX`hfYhYb
_0bbhYb"

9]bZ'i gg`XYg`?`]a Uk UbXY`g`Ui Z`X]Y 5 fhYbj]Y`ZU`h

8]Y`@YVYbgVYX]b[i b[Yb'Z0f'j]Y`Y`DZUbnybUfhYb`\UVYb'g]W\
Xi fW`X]Yb`?`]a Uk UbXY`Yf\YV`]W`j Yf`AbXYfh"<0\YfY
HYa dYfUhi fYb'i bX'i bfY[Y`a `A»][Y`B]YXYfgW`A[Y`ghY`Yb`b]W\h
bi f'Y]bY`<YfUi gZcfXYfi b[`Z0f`\Y]a]gW\Y`DZUbnyb`XUf'z'gcbXYfb
VY[0bgh][Yb'Ui W`X]Y`J YfVfY]hi b[`]bj Ug]j Yf'5fhYb`k]Y`XYf
F cgg_UghUb]Y" `@Ui h'6Yf]W\hYb'XYg`6i bXYgUa hYg`Z0f
B Uhi fgW\i hn`fBzB`k]fX'X]Y'6]cX]j Yfg]h`h'ib'8Yi hgW`UbX`Xi fW
?`]a Uj Yf`AbXYfi b[Yb'ni bY\ a YbX'[YZ`\fXYh"8]Y`J YfgW]YVi b[
XYf`J Y[YhUh]cbgdYf]cXYb'i bX`XUg'; YghU`hYb`j cb`@YVYbgf`Ai a Yb'z
X]Y`Z0f'j]Y`Y`Y]b\Y]a]gW\Y`5fhYb'i b[Y]Y][bYh'g]bX'z'j Yfgh`Af`h'X]Y
DfcV`Ya Uh]_"8UVY]`_ca a h'XYf'9f\U`h\Y]a]gW\Yf'5fhYb`Y]bY
YbhgW\Y]XYbXY`F c`Y`Z0f`XYb`2`_cgmghYa gW\i hn'ni "

8Yf`V]c`c[]gW\Y`GW\i hn`V]YhYh`Y]bYb`ghUV]`Yb`F U\ a Yb`Z0f`X]Y

² _cgmghYa Yž'XU`Y]a]gWXY'5fhYb'g]WVYf'U\fhUi gYbXY'Ub'X]Y
`c_U'Yb'6YX]b[i b[Yb'Ub[YdUggh'\UVYb" 'Afy'GWk ÅW i b['Xi fW
[YV]YhgZfYa XY'5fhYb'_Ubb'XUg; 'Y]W [Yk]W h'XYf'² _cgmghYa Y
ghOfYb"

GW UXYbgUi ga U» 'i bX'6Y_Åa dZi b['XYf
? UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa chhY

GhU]gh]_Yb'i bX'i a k Y'hVYf]W hY'nY][Ybž'XUgg'X]Y'5i gVfY]hi b['XYf
? UghUb]Yb!A]b]Yfa chhY]b'8Yi hgW'UbX'VYgcf[b]gYffY[YbXY
5i ga U» Y'Ub[Ybca a Yb'\Uh"i bhYfgi W i b[Yb'XYg'ž 'ji g'? Ø\ b!
-bgh]hi hg nY][Ybž'XUgg'XYf'6YZU'']b'ghÅXh]gW Yb'; YV]YhYb
VYgcbXYfg'\cW]ghž'XU'Fcgg_UghUb]Yb'Xcfh'\Åi Z['U'g'5''YYVÅi a Y
[YdZUbnh'k YfXYb''9]b][Y'GhÅXhY'\UVYb'VYfY]hg'gdYn]Y''Y
Dfc[fUa a Y'ni f' , VYfk UW i b['i bX'6Y_Åa dZi b['XYf'A]b]Yfa chhY
]b]h]Yfhž'i a 'XYb'6YghUbX'XYf'? UghUb]Yb'ni 'gW ØhYb"

Ni 'XYb'6Y_Åa dZi b[ga U» bU\ a Yb'nÅ\Yb'j cf'U''Ya 'X]Y
a YW Ub]gW Y'9bhZYfbi b['VYZU''YbYf'6'ÅhYf'gck]Y'X]Y': ØfXYfi b[
j cb'B Øh']b[Ybž'X]Y'X]Y '@Ufj Yb'XYf'A]b]Yfa chhY ZfYggYb''8]YgY
A Yh\cXYb'n]Y'Yb'b]W h'bi f'XUfUi ZUVž'XYb'U_hi Y''Yb'GW ÅX']b['ni
VY_Åa dZYbž'gcbXYfb'Ui W ž'Ub[Zf]gh]['X]Y'; Ygi bX\Y]h'XYf'6Åi a Y
ni 'g]W Yfb"

8]Y'F c''Y'XYf'6Yj Ò'_Yfi b[

8]Y'6Øf[Yf'gd]Y'Yb'Y]bY'YbhgW Y]XYbXY'F c''Y']a ' ?Ua dZ[Y[Yb'X]Y
A]b]Yfa chhY''GYbg]V']g]Yfi b[g_Ua dU[bYbž'k]Y'X]Y'XYg'
B Uhi fgW i hnVi bXYg'fB 5 6 I Łž'Yfa i h][Yb'5bk c\ bYfž'U_h]j 'ni f
6Y_Åa dZi b['VY]ni hfU[Yb" ' ðXYa 'g]Y'VYZU''YbY'6'ÅhYf'gUa a Y'b
i bX'Ybhgcf[Ybž'Y]ghYb'g]Y'Y]bYb'k]W h][Yb'6Y]hfU['ni a '9f\U'h
XYf'? UghUb]YbVYghÅbXY''5i » YfXYa 'i bhYfghØhYb'g]Y'Xi fW 'XUg
A Y'XYb'j cb'6YZU''gZ''Yb'X]Y'k]ggYbgW UZh]W Yb'9]bf]W hi b[Yb
XUVY]ž'X]Y'J YfVfY]hi b['XYf'A chhY'VYggYf'ni 'j YfghY\Yb'i bX
A U» bU\ a Yb'ni 'Ybhk]W_Y'b"

8 Yf'5i ghUi gW 'i bX'X]Y'Ni gUa a YbUfVY]h'nk]gW Yb'6Øf[Yfbž

?ca a i bYb'i bX': UW\cf[Ub]gUh]cbYb'g]bX'XU\Yf'j cb'YggYbn]Y''Yf
6YXYi hi b[ži a 'X]YgYb'GW\ÀX`]b['YZZY_h]j 'ni 'VY_Àa dZYb'i bX'X]Y
6]cX]j Yfg]hÀh']b'XYb'\Y]a]gW\Yb'K À'XYfb'i bX'GhÀXhYb'ni
VYk U\fyb"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W\Yb'G]Y'i bg'Ui Z.'b!U["XY