

J]Y`ZÄ`h][Y` : Y]Yf`]WÄ_Y]hYb`]a
» V]`Äi a ga cbUh`XYf` : f]YXYbg_]fWÄ Y
? fYZY`X

⇒ `» V]`Äi a ga cbUh`ZY]Yfh`X]Y` : f]YXYbg_]fWÄ Y`]b`? fYZY`X`]`f
) \$!`Ä`f][Yg`6YghY`Yb`a]h`Y]bYa` j]Y`ZÄ`h][Yb`Dfc[fUa`a` "

⇒ `GYdhYa` VYf`k]fX`]b`? fYZY`X`Y]b`VYXYi`hYb`XYg`» V]`Äi a` [YZY]Yfh`
8]Y` : f]YXYbg_]fWÄ Y`k]fX`ghc`nY`%) \$`»\`fY`U`h`»`X]YgYa``A`cbUh`
g]b`X`nU`\`fY]WÄ Y`J`YfU`b`ghU`hi`b[Yb`[Yd`U`b`h`z`X]Y`g]WÄ`U`b`
i`bhYfgWÄ`]YX`]WÄ Y`»`hYfYggYb`i`bX`5`hYfg[fi`ddYb`f]WÄ`hYb`"8]Y`
J`cfVYfY]hi`b[`i`bX`X]Y`5i`gghY`i`b[`XYf` ; YgWÄ`WÄ`hY`XYf`?`]fWÄ Y`g]b`X`
X]Y`<][`][`hg`XYg` : YghYg`"

8 Ug`Dfc[fUa`a``ghUfhYh`Ua``%"`GYdhYa` VYf`i`a``%,`i`f`a`]h`Y]bYa`
?`cbnYfh`z`XUg`j`cb`XYf`G]b`Zcb]YhhU`i`bhYf`XYf`@Y]hi`b[`j`cb`F`U`d`
GÄ`Ø`fa`U`bbg`[YghU`hYh`k]fX`"BYVYb`XYf`_`Ugg]gWÄ Yb`A`i`g]_`[]Vh`Yg`
Ui`W`a`cXYfbYfY`Gh`Ø`W`Y`z`X]Y`Ui`Z`X]Y`?`i`bghZYfh][`_Y]h`XYf`A`i`g]_`Yf`
`]\`bk`Y]gYb`"; Ya`Y]bgUa``Ua``?`Uj`]Yf`k]fX`C`[U`5bXfmi`g`WÄ Yb`_`c`
X]Y`Ni` \`Ø`fYf`a`]h`?`Ä`b[Yb`Ui`g`XYf`NY]hj`cb`6UWÄ`i`bX`6fU`a`g`
j`YfnUi`VYfb`"Gc`WÄ Y`a`i`g]_`U`]gWÄ Yb`8UfV]Yhi`b[Yb`UVYb`Y]bY`
`Ub[Y`HfUX]h]cb`]b`XYf` : f]YXYbg_]fWÄ Y`i`bX`n]Y`Y`b`X]Y`A`YbgWÄ Yb`
Ui`g`XYf`i`a` [YVi`b[`Ub`"

J]Y`ZÄ`h][Y`J`YfU`b`ghU`hi`b[Yb`]a
» V]`Äi a ga cbUh`

5a``%&"`GYdhYa` VYf`Yfk`UfhYh`X]Y`6Ygi`WÄ Yf`Y]b`i`a`cf]gh]gWÄ Yg`
<][`][`hg`?`UVUfYhh`a`]h`GhY`Z`U`b`J`Yf`U`ggY`h`z`XYggYb`9]bhf]hhgd`fY]g`
Ui`Z`&) `z`&\$`9i`fc`ZYgh[Y`Y[h`k`i`fXY`"Gc`WÄ Y`5i`Z`Ø`fi`b[Yb`a`UWÄ Yb`
X]Y` : f]YXYbg_]fWÄ Y`ni`Y]bYa``C`fh`Z`Ø`f`_i`hi`fY`Y`i`bhYf`U`hi`b[`i`bX`
fY[Yb`gca`]h`XYb`5i`ghUi`gWÄ`]bbYf`U`V`XYf` ; Ya`Y]bXY`Ub`"

9]b`k Y]hYfYf`a i g]_U`]gWXYf`@YW_YfV]ggYb`Zc`[h`Ua` `%("GYdhYa VYf
i a`%-`I` \f`ž`k Ybb`XUg`[fc»Y`6`Ugc fWXYghYf`XYf`A i g]_gW`i`Y
?fYZ`X`Ui`Zh]h"8]Yg`i`bhYf`XYf`@Y]hi`b[`j`cb`C`]j`Yf`<]fgWXY[[Yf
k]fX`Y]b`A`]i`Ui`g`?`Ugg]_ž`Dcd`i`bX`:`]a`a`i`g]_VY]b`U`h`Yb`ž`k`Ug`Y]b`Y
X]j`YfgY`5i`gk`U`U`Ub`6Y`Ub`bhYa`i`bX`BYi`Ya`j`Yfgdf]W`h`ž`k`cfUi`Z
g]W`X`Y`A`i`g]_]YV`UVYf`ZfYi`Yb`_`Ò`bb`Yb`"

8]Y`J`Y`Z`U`h`XYg`Dfc[fUa`a`g`gd]Y[Y`h`g]W`U`i`W`]b`XYb`6Y]hf`À[Yb
j`cb`h`U`Y`bh]YfhYb`?`Ø`b`gh`Y`fb`k`]XYf`ž`k`]Y`VY]gd]Y`gk`Y]gY`XYf`7]hm!
?`Ub`hc`fY]ž`X]Y`Ua` `%) "GYdhYa VYf`i`a` `%,`I` \f`U`i`Zh]h" <]Yf`k`]fX`X]Y
@]YVY`ni`f`7` \cf`a`i`g]_`Xi`fW`X`Y`@]YXYf`j`cb`<`Ub`g!`š`Œ[`6`Ō`W`Y`Yf`ž`
XYa`j`U`h`Yf`XYf`@Y]hYf]b`7` \f]gh]UbY`6`Ō`W`Y`Yf`ž`[Yk`Ø`fX][h`"

9]b`VYgcbXYfYg`<][\`][\h`ghY`h`XYf`J`cfhfU[`j`cb`ž`ghi`g`;`Y]`i`ZYž
DUghc`f`U`i`g`i`fY]Vi`f[ž`Ua` `%-`"GYdhYa VYf`i`a` `%,`I` \f`XUf`"9f`k`]fX
XUg`H`Y`a`U`8]Y`U`h`Y]gh]gWXY`;`YgY`g`W`U`Z`h`i`bX`j` \fY`?`]fWXY
VY`Y`i`W`h`Y`b`i`bX`XUVY]Y]b`Yb`gd`Ub`b`Yb`XYb`8]g`_i`fg`Ub`ghc»Yb`"8Yf
9]bh]h`h`ni`X]YgYf`J`Yf`Ub`gh`U`hi`b[`VYhf`À[h`n`Y` \b`9i`fc`i`bX`[]Vh`XYb
6Ygi`W`Y`fb`X]Y`A`Ò[`]W`_Y]h`ni`f`_f]h]gWXYb`5i`gY]b`Ub`XYfgY`hni`b[
a`]h`U`_hi`Y`Y`b`i`[YgY`g`W`U`Z`h]W`Y`b`i`fU[Yb`"

: YghhU[g[chhYgX]Ybgh`i`bX`5VgW`i`ggZY]Yf

8]Y`:`Y`gh`]W`_Y]hYb`YffY]W`Y`b`i` \fYb`<`Ō`Y`di`b`_`h`Ua` `&&"GYdhYa VYf
a`]h`Y]b`Ya`i`Y`gh[chhYgX]Yb`gh`ž`XYf`i`a` `%\$`I` \f`i`bhYf`XYf`@Y]hi`b[
j`cb`7` \f]ghcd` \D]ghc`f]i`gž`XYa`j`]nY!Df`À`gYg`XYf`9]Ub[Y`]gWXYb
?`]fWXY`]a`F` \Y]b`Ub`X`ž`gh`U`h`Z]b`XYb`k`]fX`"8`Ub`U`W`X`Zc`[h`Y]b
Cf[Y`_`cbnYfh`a`]h`XYa`j`h`U`]Yb]gWXYb`Cf[Ub]ghYb`DUc`c`C`fYb]i`a
%,`I` \f`"

8Yb`_f`Ō`b`Yb`XYb`5VgW`i`gg`XYg`ž`V]`À`i`a`ga`cb`U`hg`V]`XYh`Ua` `&-`"
GYdhYa VYf`Y]b`[fc»Yg`;`Ya`Y]b`XYZY`gh`ž`k`Y`W`Y`g`i`a` `%\$`I` \f`a`]h
Y]b`Ya`i`Ua`]Yb[chhYgX]Yb`gh`VY[]bb`h" `a`5bgW`i`gg[]Vh`Y`g`A`i`g]_ž`
;`Y[f]`h`Y`g`i`bX`?`i`W`Y`b`ž`gc`XUgg`Z`Œ`Y`XYb`i`Ui`a`Yb`Y`hk`Ug`XUVY]`]gh`
Gc`W`Y`i`Y`gh`Y`gh`À`f`_Yb`X]Y`i`Ya`Y]bgW`U`Z`h`i`bX`gc`f[Yb`Z`Œ`Y]b
A`]hY]b`Ub`XYf`ž`XUg`]b`XYf` \Yi`h][Yb`NY]h`VYgcbXYfg`k`]W`h][`]gh`"

5`Y` `b`Zc`fa`Uh]cbYb`ni`XYb`J`Yf`Ub`gh`U`hi`b[Yb`ž`H]W`_Y`hg`i`bX`k`Y]hYfYb

8 YhU]`g`Z]bXYb` ðhYfYgg]YfhY`Ui W`Ui ZXYf`K YVgY]hY`XYf
: f]YXYbg_]fWY`? fYZY`X`i bhYf`Zf]YXYbg_]fWY!_fYZY`X"XY"

9]b` ð\ f`j` c``Yf`9f]bbYfi b[Yb

9]b`gc`WYg` ð V]`Ai a`nY][`h`b]W`h`bi`f`X]Y`Ub[Y`; YgW`]W`hY`XYf
: f]YXYbg_]fWY`ž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`XYfYb`Ub`U`hYbXY`6YXYi`hi`b[`Z0f
X]Y`; Ya`Y]bgW`UZh`]b`? fYZY`X"8]Y`J`YfUbghU`hi`b[Yb`k`c``Yb`b]W`h
bi`f`ni`f`: Y]Yf`XYf`J`Yf[Ub[Yb`Y]h`VY]hfU[Yb`ž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`bYi`Y
DYfgdY`_h]j`Yb`Z0f`X]Y`ni`_0bZh[Y`9bhk`]W`_i`b[`XYf`?]fWY`i`bX`Y`fYf
F`c``Y`]b`XYf`; YgY``gW`UZh`h`Ya`Uh]g]YfYb``9g`]gh`Y]bY`; Y`Y[Yb`Y]h
Z0f`U`Y`; YbYfUh]cbYb`ž`ni`gUa`a`Ybni`_ca`a`Yb`i`bX`XYb`fY]W`hi`a
XYf`HfUX]h]cb`ni`Z]Yfb`ž`X]Y`X]YgY`9]bf]W`hi`b[`0VYf`X]Y` ð\ fY
_i`h]j`]Yfh`U`h"

8 Yf`GYdhYa` VYf`k`]fX`b]W`h`bi`f`Z0f`X]Y`; Ya`Y]bXY`? fYZY`X`Y]b
Ui`ZfY[YbXYf`A`cbUhž`gcbXYfb`gd]Y[Y`h`Ui`W`Y]bYb
U``[Ya`Y]b[0`h][Yb`HfYbX`]b`j`]Y`Yb`Gh`X`hYb`k`]XYf``: YghY`i`bX
: Y]Yfb`g]bX`Y]b`HY]`XYg`_i`hi`fY``Yb`@YVYbgž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`bUW
XYb`9]bgW`f`Ab`_i`b[Yb`XYf`Y`hnhYb` ð\ fY`Xi`fW`X]Y
7CJ`8!%-!DUbXYa`]Y`` ð`X]YgYb`NY]hYb`k`i`fXY`X]Y`gcn]U`Y
ðhYfU`_h]cb`ghUf`_`]a`]h]Yfhž`k`Ug`XUni`Z0\`fhž`XUgg
; Ya`Y]bgW`UZh]j`YfUbghU`hi`b[Yb`a`Y`f`XYb`b`Y`[YgW`Å`hnh`k`YfXYb"

8]YgY`J`YfUbghU`hi`b[Yb`hfU[Yb`b]W`h`bi`f`ni`f`Gh`Å`f`_i`b[`XYf
; Ya`Y]bgW`UZh`VY]ž`gcbXYfb`Z0fXYfb`Ui W`XUg`_i`hi`fY``Y`@YVYb
Y]bYf`GhUX`h"8]Y`?`ca`V]bUh]cb`Ui`g`A`i`g]_ž`? UVUfY`h`i`bX`fY`][`]0gYb
5b[YVchYb`gdf]W`h`Y]bY`VfY]hY`N]Y`[fi`ddY`Ub`i`bX`Z0fXYfh`gc`X]Y
F`Y`j`]hU`]g]Yfi`b[`XYg`[YgY``gW`UZh]W`Yb`@YVYbg``@Ui`h`Y]bYf
l`a`ZfU[Y`XYg` ð`gh]hi`hg`Z0f`8Ya`cg`_cd]Y`5``YbgVUW`Ui`g`XYa` ð\ f
&\$&'`[YVYb`+,`i`XYf`8Yi`hgW`Yb`Ubž`g]W`b`UW`XYf`DUbXYa`]Y
bUW`gcn]U`Yb`?`cbhU`hYb`i`bX`J`YfUbghU`hi`b[Yb`ni`gY`bYb"

A`i`g]_U`]gW`Y`J`]Y`ZU`h`i`bX`_i`hi`fY``Y 6YfY]W`Yfi`b[

8]Y`J`YfUbghU`hi`b[Yb`]b`? fYZY`X`i`a`ZUggYb`Y]b`VfY]hYg`GdY`_hfi`a

Ub`A i g]_f]W\hi b[Ybžj cb`_`Ugg]gW\Yf`A i g]_`ØVYf`? UVUfYh`V]g`\\b
ni`Dcd!`i bX`:`]`a a i g]_`"i bhYf`XYf`@Y]hi b[`j cb`YfZU`fYbYb
8]f][YbhYb`i bX`?ØbghYfb`k YfXYb`X]YgY`?cbnYfhY`b]W\h`bi f
l bhYf`U`hi b[`V]YhYbž`gcbXYfb`Ui W\`ni f`6]`Xi b[`i bX`ni a
_i`hi fY`Yb`5i ghUi gW`VY]hfU[Yb`"8]Y`G]bZcb]YhU`k]fX`a]h`XYf
5i ZØ`fi b[`_`Ugg]gW\Yf`K Yf`_Y`Y]bYb`9]bV`]W`_]b`XUg`9fVY`[fc»Yf
?ca`dcb]ghYb`k]Y`6UW`i bX`6fU`a g[YVYbž`k À`fYbX`XUg
6`Ugc fW\YghYf`a]h`a cXYfbYb`5ffUb[Ya Ybhg`YVYbZU`g`Øb[YfY
Ni `ØfYf`Ub gdfYW\Yb`a ØW`hY"

8]Y`J]Y`ZU`h`XYf`Ub[YVchYbYb`_i`hi fY`Yb`5_h]j]h`hYb`gd]Y[Y`h`g]W\
Ui W\`b`XYb`i bhYfgW\]YX`]W\Yb`N]Y`[fi`ddYb`k]XYfž`X]Y
Ub[YgdfcW\Yb`k YfXYb`"9g`k]fX`Yfk UfhYhž`XUgg`:`Ua `]Ybž`À`hYfY
A YbgW\Yb`i bX`ž [YbX`]W\Y`X]Y`J YfUbghU`hi b[Yb`VYgi W\Ybž`k Ug
XYb`]bhYf[YbYfUh]cbU`Yb`5i ghUi gW`ZØfXYfb`_Ubb`"ž`Y]bYf
; YgY`gW\UZhž`X]Y`ni bY`a YbX`X][]hU`Yf`k]fXž`g]bX`gc`W\Y`UbU`c[Yb
9f`YVb]ggY`i bYf`Àgg`]W\`ZØf`XYb`gcn]U`Yb`Ni gUa`a Yb`U`h"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W\Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`b!U["XY