

B Yi b_]fWk Yb. '9]b 'a YX]hYffUbYg'DUfUX]Yg
]a ' ; UfhYb 'XYf'GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bn

9bhXYW_Yb'G]Y'XUg'a YX]hYffUbY'DUfUX]Yg'XYf': Ua]]Y
GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bn]'b'BYi b_]fWk Yb.'Y]b'Y]bn][Ufh][Yf'; UfhYbž
XYf'i f'Ui VgZY'']b['Vf]b[h"

⇒ a 'a U'Yf]gWk Yb'BYi b_]fWk Ybž'k c'XYf'DchnVYf['X]Y'@UbXgWk UZh
dfÄ[hžYbhXYW_Yb'k]f'Y]b [Ubn'VYgcbXYfYg?'Y]bcX.'XYb'; UfhYb
XYf': Ua]]Y'GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bn''<]Yf'YbhghY\h'Y]b'bU\Yni
a YX]hYffUbYg'DUfUX]Ygž]'b'XYa 'X]Y'6Yk c\bYf'XUg'; YZØ\''XYg
I f'Ui Vg'[Ubn'c\bY'FY]gYghfYgg['Yb]Y»Yb''8i fWk 'X]Y'bUWk 'GØXYb
Ui g[Yf]Wk hYhY '@U[Y'i bX'X]Y'Xcfh'UbgÄgg][Yb'DZUbnyb'ZØ\ 'h'a Ub
g]Wk 'k]Y]b'Y]bYf'UbXYfYb'K Y'h"

9g'k Uf'Y]b'hmd]gWk 'XYi hgWk Yf'HU[ž'XYf'6Ygi Wk 'XYf'F <9-BD: 5@N
k Uf'ni bÄWk gh'Xi fWk 'XYb'K YhhYfVYf]Wk h'Ui Z'F Y[Yb'Y]b[YghY''h"
8cWk 'X]Y'GcbbY'\]Y'h'9]bni ['i bX'VYgWk YfhY'XYb'6Ygi Wk Yfb
ghfU\ 'YbXYb'GcbbYbgWk Y]b''<Y'[U'GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bnž'X]Y'ghc'nY
<Ui g\Yff]bž'VYgWk fY]Vh'X]YgYb'VYgcbXYfYb'c'fh'i bX'VYf]Wk hYh'j'cb
XYf]'bhYbg]j Yb'GcbbYbY]bghfU\ 'i b[']'b'X]YgYf'<Ø\Y'' K]f''Y[Yb
\]Yf'j'c''Ui Z'XYf'GØXgY]hY ž'gU[h'g]Y'i bX'ZØ[h'\]bni ž'XUgg'X]Y
nU\ 'fY]Wk Yb'GhY]bUi ZVUi hYb'i bX'XYf'\Y''Y'GWk chYf'Ui Z'XYf
HYffUggY'ni f'9f\Ø\i b['XYf'a YX]hYffUbYb'5ha cgd\ÄfY'VY]hfU[Yb"

9]b '@YVYb ']a 'GhY]' \ Ub[

8Yf'; UfhYb ']gh'b]Wk h'XUg'Y]bn][Y'VYa Yf_Ybgk YfhY'A Yf_a U'XYg
@YVYbg'XYf': Ua]]Y'GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bn''ϑ']\fYa 'Nk Y]ZUa]]Yb\Ui g
'YVYb'Ui Wk 'X]Y'5b[Y\Øf][Yb'j'cb'<Y'[U'GhYbgWk_Y!<Y]bn
GWk k]Y[Yfa i hhYf''8]YgY''YVYbX][Y'K c\b[Ya Y]bgWk UZh]gh'Y]b
ZYghYf'6YghUbXhY]' '\fYg'5''hU[g''5b'X]YgYa 'HU['k Uf'X]Y

GWk]Y[Yfa i hYf'VY]XYf'5fVY]hzi bX'GWk]Y[Ybgc\ b'; i bhYf
_Y\fhY'bUW'Y]bYa 'F UgYba A\YfY]bgUhn'ni fØW_ž'k Ug'X]Y
[Ya Y]bgUa Y'NY]h'i a gc'k Yfhj c''Yf'a UW'hY' '[Ubn'ni 'gWk Y][Yb
j cb'XYf'gY'Vgh[YVUW_YbYb'<Y]XY'VYf!HUfhYž'X]Y'ZØf'Yhk Ug
_i 'j]bUf]gWYb'; Ybi gg'gcf[hY"

<Y'[U'GhYbgW_ Y!<Y]bn']gh'b]W'h'bi f'<Ui gZfUi ž'gcbXYfb'Ui W
A U_Yf]b''9]b][Y'\fYf'?i bXYb'g]bX'i G!5a Yf]_UbYfž'X]Y'g]W'ZØf
X]Y'F Y[]cb'j]bhYfYgg]YfYb'' ÆfY'9fZU\fi b[Yb'U'g
'fY]g[YgW'ÀzhgZØ\ fYf]b'XYf'@UbXZfUi Yb'\UVYb']\f'ni XYa 'Y]bYb
[fØbYb'8Ui a Yb'j Yf']Y\Yb'' Æa 'Ŗ\f'&\$+\$+nc['X]Y': Ua]]Y'j cb'XYf
[Y[YbØVYf']Y[YbXYb'GhfU»YbgY]hY']b']\f'bYi Yg'Ni \Ui gYž'Y]b
6Ui dfc'Y_hž'XUg'Ui ZXYa 'ghY]'Yb'<Ub['Xi fWUi g
<YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb'Vch"

5a 'GhY'\Ub['ni 'VUi Ybž']gh'b]W'h'Y]bZUW ž'Yf'Ài hYfh'X]Y
* - !Ŗ\f][Y'i bX'XYb_h'Ub'U''X]Y'5fVY]hYb'ni fØW_ž'X]Y'bchk YbX][
k UfYbž'i a 'XUg'; fi bXghØW_ni 'ghUV']]g]YfYb''8cW'g]Y'gh
ØVYfnYi [h' 5i g'YXYa 'GhY'\Ub['_Ubb'a Ub'Yhk Ug'a UWYb"
8]YgY'dcg]hj Y'9]bghY''i b['gd]Y[Y'h'g]W']b'XYf'; YghU'hi b[']\fYg
; UfhYbg'k]XYfž'XYf'a]hj]Y''@YVY'i bX'<]b[UVY'[YdZY[h'k]fX"

8]Y'Ui »Yf[Yk Ø\ b']WYb'k YhYfj Yf\À'hb]ggY']b'X]YgYf'F Y[]cb
Yfa Ø['WYb'Yg'j]Y'ZÀ'h][Yb'DZUbnYb'ni '[YXY]\Ybž'k Ug'XYa
; UfhYb'Y]bYb'Yi fcdÀ]gWYb': 'U]f'j Yf'Y'\h''<]Yf'k UWgYb'b]W'h'bi f
Y]b\Y]a]gWY'6'i a Ybž'gcbXYfb'Ui W'gc'WYž'X]Y'a Ub'gcbgh]b
@AbXYfb'k]Y'GdUb]Yb'cXYf'ÆU']Yb'Z]bXYh''8]YgY'A]gW'i b['a UW h
XYb'; UfhYb'j cb'<Y'[U'GhYbgW_ Y!<Y]bn'ni 'Y]bYa '[Ubn'gdYn]Y''Yb
Cfhž'XYf'gY]bYg['Y]WYb'gi W'h"

8i fW'X]Y'<Ub['U[Y'i bX'X]Y'fY]nj c''Y'; YghU'hi b[']'gh'XYf'; UfhYb
b]W'h'bi f'Y]b'<cfh'XYf'9f\c'i b[ž'gcbXYfb'Ui W'Y]b'6Y]gd]Y''ZØf'X]Y
'fYUh]j]hÀhi bX'XYb': 'Y]»'XYf'9][YbhØa Yf''9g']gh'Y]b' Cfhž'Ub'XYa
X]Y'A Ø\Yb'\fYf'5fVY]h'XYi h']W'g]W'hVUf'k YfXYb'bi bX'k c'g]Y
'YXYb'HU['Ui Zg'B Yi Y'XYb'Ŗ\fYgnY]hYb'VY[Y[bYb'_ØbbYb"
6YgcbXYfg]a 'Gca a Yfž'k Ybb'X]Y'd'UbhgWYb']b'XYb'V'Ø\YbXYb
: UfVYb'ghfU\Yb'bi bX'X]Y'GcbbYbghfU\Yb'Xi fW'XUg'6'ÀhhYfXUW
VfYWYbž'j Yfk UbXY'h'g]W'XYf'; UfhYb']b'Y]bY'k U\fy'cUgY"

9]b`Y]b`UXYbXYf`F ØW_ni [gc fh

8]Y`Y]b`UXYbXY`5ha cgd`ÅfY`ja` ; UfhYb`i bX`ja` <Ui g`n]Y`h`b]W`h
bi f` : Ua`]Y`i bX` : fYi bXY`Ubž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`B UW`V Ufbž`X]Y`]b`XYf
I a` [YVi b` [`k c`bYb`" `9g`nY][hž`k]Y`k]W`h][`gc`W`Y`F`ØW_ni [gc fhY
]a` `5`hU[`g]bXž`]bgVYgcbXYfY`]b`NY]hYbž`]b`XYbYb`XUg`@YVYb
`Y`_h]gW`i bX`YfUi gZcfXYfbX`gY]b`_Ubb`" `8 Ug`a` YX]hYffUbY` : `U]fž
XUg`XYf` ; UfhYb`Ui gghfU`hž`hfÅ[h`XUni`VY]ž`XUgg`a` Ub`ZØf`Y]bYb
A ca` Ybh`X]Y`Gcf[Yb`XYg`5`hU[g`]b`hYf`g]W`UggYb`_Ubb`i bX
Y]bZUW`XUg`@YVYb` [Yb]Y`» h"

8]YgY` ; YgW`]W`hY`XYf` : Ua`]Y`GhYbgW`_Y!<Y]bn`i bX`]\fYg` ; UfhYbg
]gh`Y]b`6Y]gd]Y`XUZØfž`k]Y`a` Ub`a`]h`Y]bYa` GhØW`_@UbX`j]Y` : fYi XY
i bX`9fZØ`i b` [`gW`UZZYb`_Ubb`" `5i W`k`Ybb`XUg`6Ui dfc`Y`_h`Ua
GhY`]\Ub[`j]Y`Y`<YfUi gZcfXYfi b` [Yb`a`]hg]W`VfUW`hYž`k`i`fXY`Yg`ni
Y]bYa`YfZØ`YbXYb`i bX`gW`ØbYb`@YVYb`" `8Yf` ; UfhYb`V`Y]Vh`b]W`h
bi f`Y]b`Cfh`XYf`9bhgdUb`bi b` [ž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`Y]b`F`Ui a`ž`]b`XYa
9f]bbYfi b` [Yb` [YgW`UZZYb`i bX` [YhY]`h`k`YfXYb`_ØbbYb`"

8]Y`FY[]cb`fi bX`i a`BYi b_]fW`Yb`]gh`b]W`h`bi f`_UbXgW`UZh`]W`
fY]nj`c`ž`gcbXYfb`U`h`Ui W`Y]bY`_Ub[Y`HfUX]h]cb`]b`XYf
@UbXk]fhgW`UZh`" `8]Y`Zfi W`hVUfYb`6ØXYb`i bX`XUg`a`]XY`?`]a` U
V]YhYb`]XYU`Y`6YX]b[i b` [Yb`ZØf`XYb`5bVUi`j`cb`CVgh`i bX
 ; Ya` ØgY`" `8Yf`K`Y]bVUi`U`h`b`X]YgYf` ; Y[YbX`Y]bY`VYgcbXYfY
6YXYi hi b` [ž`]\ghcf]gW` [Yk`UW`gYb`i bX`Ui W`Y`Yi hY`bcW`j`cb
k]fhgW`UZh`]W`Yf`FY`Yj`Ub`n`" `b`XYb`YhnhYb`d`]\fYb`]gh`Y]b`HfYbX`ni
VYcVUW`hYbž`XUgg`]a` a`Yf`a`Y`f`<cVVm[Åf`hbYf`g]W`ZØf`XYb`5bVUi
j`cb`a`YX]hYffUbYb`DZUb`nYb`]bhYfYgg]YfYb`" `DfcXi`_hY`k`]Y`C`j`Ybž
HfUi`VYb`i bX`?`fÅi`hYf`YfcVYfb`X]Y` ; ÅfhYbž`XU`g]Y`b]W`h`bi f`c`dh]gW`
UbgdfYW`YbX`g]bXž`gcbXYfb`Ui W`_i`_]bUf]gW`Y`J]Y`ZU`h`V]YhYb`"

9]bV`]W_Y`]b`X]Y`c_U`Y` : `cfU`i bX` : Ui bU

8]Y` : `cfU`XYf`FY[]cb`i a`BYi b_]fW`Yb`]gh`Xi fW`Y]bY`J]Y`nU`_Ub
DZUb`nYbUfhYb` [YdfÅ[hž`X]Y`g]W`Y`fj`c`ffU[YbX`Ub`XUg`c_U`Y
?`]a` U`Ub[YdUggh`UVYb`" `6YgcbXYfg`5fhYb`k`]Y`@Uj`YbXYž
F`cga`Uf]b`i bX`j`YfgW`]YXYbY`N]hfi`gVÅi`a`Y`Z]bXYb`]b`XYb` ; ÅfhYb
XYf`5bk`c`bYf`]\fYb`D`Uhn`" `8]YgY`DZUb`nYb`g]bX`b]W`h`bi f`gW`Øb

Ubni gY\Ybž'gcbXYfb'n]Y\Yb'Ui W\`nU\`fY]WXY`đgY_hYb'k]Y'6]YbYb
i bX'GWa YhYf`]b[Y'Ubž'k Ug'ZØf'X]Y'6]cX]j Yfg]h`h'XYf`i a [YVi b[
j cb`[fc»Yf'6YXYi hi b[`]gh"

- @Uj YbXY`'`gcf[h'ZØf'Y]bY'a YX]hYffUbY'5ha cgd\`ÄfY'i bX
n]Y\`h'6]YbYb'Ub"
- Fcga Uf]b'`VY_Ubbh'ZØf'gY]bY'J Yfk YbXi b[`]b'XYf'?ØWXY
i bX'gY]bY'fcVi ghY`BUhi f"
- N]hfcbybVUi a `cVkc\`Yf'Yhk Ug'a Y\`f'DZY[Y'VYbØh][hž
YfZfYi h'Yf'g]W\`[fc»Yf'6Y`]YVh\Y]h"

8Yf'9]bZi gg'XYf'@UbXgW\UZh'Ui Z'XUg'?`]a U'gd]Y'h'Y]bY
YbhgWXY]XYbXY`Fc`Y"8]Y`< Ub[`U[Y'gcf[h'XUZØfž'XUgg'k Ufa Y'@ Zh
ghY][h'i bX'g]W\`]b'XYb'; ÄfhYb'ghUi hž'k Ug'ni `Y]bYa `]bg[YgUa h
a]XYfYb'A]_fc_]a U'ZØ\fh": Øf'X]Y'5bk c\`bYf'V]YhYh'X]Yg'XYb
J cfhY]ž'XUgg'g]Y`Y]bY'J]Y`nU\`j cb'DZUbnyb'YfZc`[fY]W\`_i `h]j]YfYb
_ØbbYbž'X]Y]b`_Ø\`YfYb'; Y[YbXYb'b]W\`h[YXY]\Yb'k ØfXYb"

Ni gÄhn`]W\`gd]Y'h'XUg'6Yk i gghgY]b'ZØf'bUW\`U'h][Y
; UfhYbVUi dfU_h]_Yb'Y]bY'k UW\`gYbXY`Fc`Y]a `5`hU[`XYf'; ÄfhbYf'
8Yf'9]bgUhn'j cb'bUhØf`]W\`Yb'8Øb[Ya]hY'b'i bX'X]Y': ØfXYfi b[
j cb`đgY_hYbZfYi bX`]W\`_Y]h'k YfXYb'ja a Yf'VY`]YVhYfž'i a `X]Y
Ø_c`c[]gW\`Y'6U`UbW`ni `i bhYfghØhnYb"

6YgcbXYfY`< YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb'i bX 5bdUggi b[Yb

8]Y'VYgcbXYfYb`_]a Uh]gW\`Yb'6YX]b[i b[Yb'Vf]b[Yb'YXcW\`Ui W\`
< YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb'a]h'g]W\`"GhUf_Y`FY[YbZÄ`Y`_ØbbYb'X]Y`< Ø[Y`
]a `: fØ\`U\`f'YfcX]YfYbž'k Ug'ni `Y]bYa `J Yf'i gh'XYf
6cXYbZfi W\`hVUf_Y]h'ZØ\`fYb`_Ubb" <]Yf'g]bX`_fYUh]j Y`@Øgi b[Yb
[YZfU[hž'i a `XYb'6cXYb'ni `gW\`ØhnYb'i bX'[`Y]W\`nY]h][`Y]bY
`YVYbX][Y'; UfhYb`UbXgW\`UZh'ni `VYk U\`fYb"8 Ug'5b`Y[Yb'j cb
HYffUggYb'i bX'UbXYfYb'GW\`i hma U» bU\`a Yb`_Ubb`\`Y`ZYbž'X]Y'9fXY
Ub`]fYa `D`Uhn'ni `U`hYb'i bX'XYb'; ÄfhbYfb'Y]bYb'g]W\`YfYb`FUi a
ni `V]YhYbž'i a `]fY'DZUbnyb'ni `Y[Yb"

đ`XYb`YhnhYb`đ\`fYb`]gh'Ui W\`X]Y'6YXYi hi b[`XYf'bUhi fbU\`Yb

; UfhYb[YghU`hi b[`]b`XYb`J cfXYf[fi bX`[YfØW_h" `a a Yf`a Y`f
A YbgWYb`YbhgWY]XYb`g]WY`XUZØfž`\fYb`; ÅfhYb`Y]bYb
k]`Xfca Ubh]gWYb`7\UfU_hYf`ni `j Yf`Y]\Ybž`k Ug`b]WY`hibi f`gWY`Øb
Ui gg]Y`hž`gcbXYfb`Ui WY`XYf`\Y]a]gWYb`H]Yfk Y`h`ni [i hY`_ca a h"
8]Y`K]YXYf`YfghY``i b[`bUhØf`]WYf`@YVYbgfÅi a Y`]b`; ÅfhYb`hfÅ[h
ni f`9f`U`hi b[`XYf`6]cX]j Yfg]hÅh`VY]i bX`gWY`UZh`Y]b`\Ufa`cb]gWY`g
Ni gUa`a Yb`YVYb`j`cb`A YbgWY`i bX`BUhi`f"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi WY`Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`b!U["XY