

5bb!?!Uhf]b`6Yf[Yf`fYhhYh`C`ma d]U!6fcbnY
a]h`9`Za YhYf\Y`XYb!A ca Ybh

5bb!?!Uhf]b`6Yf[Yf`fYhhYh`a]h`[Y\U`hYbYa `9`Za YhYf`X]Y
C`ma d]U!6fcbnYa YXU]`Y`XYf`XYi hgWXYb`i » VU`Yf]bbYb
[Y[Yb`GdUb]Yb"

9]b`i bj Yf[Ygg`]WXYf`A ca Ybh`ZØf`X]Y
XYi hgWXY`i : fUi YbZi » VU`a UbbgWUZh

8]Y`XYi hgWXY`i » VU`bUh]cbU`a UbbgWUZh`XYf`i : fUi Yb`\Uh]b
Y]bYa `Ya ch]cbU`Yb`8i Y`i a `X]Y`C`ma d]U!6fcbnYa YXU]`Y`[Y[Yb
GdUb]Yb`Y]bY`XfUa Uh]gWXY`K YbXY`Yf`YVh"8Ub`_`XYf
\YfUi gfU[YbXYb`@Y]ghi b[`j cb`Hcf\ØhYf]b`5bb!?!Uhf]b`6Yf[Yf
_cbbhY`XUg`HYUa `a]h`Y]bYa `%.\$!G]Y[`XUg`DcX]i a `YffY]WXYb`i bX
g]W`gca]h`X]Y`A YXU]`Y`g]WXYfb`i` ÆfY`VYY]bXfi W_YbXY`DUfUXYb`i]b
XYf`B UW`gd]Y`nY]h`\UVYb`b]W`h`bi f`XUg`Gd]Y`Yb`hgW]YXYbž
gcbXYfb`Ui W`X]Y`<YfnYb`j]Y`Yf`i : Ubg`YfcVYfh"

8 Yf`Yb hgWXY]XYbXY`9`Za YhYf

⇒`XYf`YbhgWXY]XYbXYb`D\UgY`XYg`Gd]Y`gž[YbUi Yf`[YgU[h`i]b`XYf
bYi bhYb`A]bi hY`XYf`B UW`gd]Y`nY]hž`\UhY`GdUb]Ybg`? Ud]h`Ab]b
5`Yi]U`Di hY`Ug`X]Y`A Ø[`]W`_Y]hž`]\fY`A UbbgWUZh`i]b`i : Ø\fi b[`ni
Vf]b[Yb"5b`X]YgYf`GhY`Y`nY][hY`6Yf[Yf`Y]bY`VYa Yf`_Yb`gk YfhY
@Y]ghi b[ž]bXYa `g]Y`XYb`i : ci `Y`Za YhYf`\]Y`h"i` ÆW`k Uf`Y]bZUW
ca d`Yhh`YYf`ž`Yf``ÀfhY`X]Y`" `!`À\f][Yž`bUW`XYa `g]Y`U`g
GW`ØggY`ni`X]YgYa `9fZc`[`]YZY]Yfh`k i fXY"i`Hfch`XYg`8fi W`g`i bX
XYf`Ya ch]cbU`Yb`5bgdUbbi b[`_cbbhY`g]Y`]bgh]b`_hj`fYU[]YfYb`i bX
X]Y`?i [Y`UVk Y\fyb"

9]b]bgh]b_h'cXYf'GhfUhY []Y3

6Yf[Yf'[YghUbXž'XUgg'g]Y'g]Wk' b]Wk'h'Ui ZX]YgY'G]hi Uh]cb
j c fVYfY]hYb' _cbbhYž'XU'\f'?cdZ'ni 'X]YgYa 'NY]hdi b_h' Y]bZUWk
Ui g[YgWkU'hYh 'k Uf''8]Yg'k]fZiX]Y': fU[Y'Ui Zž'cV'9a ch]cbYb'i bX
fYU']gh]gWkY'GY'Vghk U\fbY\ a i b['Y]bY'F'c''Y']a '@Y]ghi b[ggdcfh
gd]Y'Yb''ž'Y]bYa 'A ca Ybž'']b'XYa 'a Ub'U'g'5h\Yh]b'i bhYf'8fi W_
ghY\hž'_Ubb'Yg'j cb'J cfhY]'gY]bž'XYb'Ya ch]cbU'Yb'6U''Ugh
UVni VUi Ybž'i a 'Ui Zž'hi]h]cb'i bX'žgh]b_h'ni fØW_ni [fY]ZYb'' 9g
k Uf'Y]bZUWk'žgh]b_h ž'gU[hY'6Yf[Yf'ØVYf']\fY '@Y]ghi b["

K YfhgWk Āhni b ['j cb'HfU]bYf'i bX'HYUa

6YgcbXYfg'VYa Yf_Ybgk Yfh']ghž'XUgg'5bb!?'Uhf]b'6Yf[Yf'X]YgYb
[Y\U'hYbYb'9'Za YhYf'<cfgh'<fi VYgWk'k]Xa YhYž'XYf'g]Y'j cf'XYa
C'mad]Uhi fb]Yf'ni f'Bi a a Yf'%YfbUbbh'\Uh''8]Yg'nY][h'X]Y'h]YZfY
J YfV]bXi b['nk]gWkYb'XYb'Gd]Y'Yf]bbYb'i bX']\fYa 'HfU]bYfž'XYf'ja
Gd]Y'' [Y[Yb'GdUb]Yb'gY]b''YhnhYg'Gd]Y''U'g'6i bXYghfU]bYf'VYghf]hh"
8Ug'k Uf'Y]bZUWk'ZØf']\bž'XUgg'Yf'Ub'a]Wk' [Y['Ui Vh'\Uh ž'gU[hY
6Yf[Yf'i bX'VYhc bhYž'k]Y'k]Wk h['XUg'J YfhfUi Yb'j cb'HfU]bYfb'ZØf'
Gd]Y'Yf]bbYb'']gh"

9a ch]cbYb'i bX'HYUa [Y]gh

5'g'6Yf[Yf'bUWk']\fYf'DUfUXY'j cb']\fYb'A]hgd]Y'Yf]bbYb' [YZY]Yfh
k i fXYž'k Uf'XUg'ZØf'g]Y'Y]b' i bZUggVUf'gWk'ØbYg'; YZØ\'' 8]YgY
A ca YbhY'XYg'HYUa [Y]ghg'i bX'XYf'i bhYfghØhni b['g]bX'YggYbn]Y''
ZØf'XYb'9fZc'['ja 'Gdcfh''žX]j]Xi Y''Y '@Y]ghi b[Yb'g]bX'cZi'bi f
Xi fWk'XUg'Ni gUa a Ybk]f_Yb'XYg'HYUa g'i bX'XUg'J YfhfUi Yb
i bhYfY]bUbXYf'a Ø['Wk' 'VYgcbXYfg']b'VYgcbXYfg'Ya ch]cbU'Yb
Gd]Y'Ybž'X]Y'ZØf'X]Y'[YgUa hY'?Uff]YfY'Y]bYf'Gdcfh'Yf]b'j cb
6YXYi hi b['g]bX"

: Un]h. '9]b'A ca Ybh'ZØf'X]Y'; YgWk]Wk hY

8]Y'YfZc'[fY]WkY'5Vk Y\ f'XYg'9'Za YhYfg'\Uh'b]Wk'h'bi f'ZØf'X]Y
XYi hgWkY'A UbbgWk UZi'ni 'Y]bYa 'VYXYi hYbXYb'9fZc'['VY][YhfU[Ybž

gcbXYfb`Ui W`XUg`DchYbn]U`ZØf`Y]bY`bYi Y; YbYfUh]cb`↑ b[Yf
HU`YbhY`Ui Z[YnY][h`5bb! ?Uhf]b`6Yf[Yf`ghY`h'igma Vc`]gW`ZØf`XYb
?Ua dZ[Y]gh'i bX`X]Y`GhÅf`Y`XYf`XYi hgW`Yb
: fUi YbZi » VU`UVhY]`i b[`i bX`]bgd]f]Yfhj]Y`Yž`X]Y`]a `: i » VU`gY`Vgh
U_h]j `k YfXYb`a ÒW`hYb" Æf`9fZc`[` _ÖbbhY`Y]b`YbhgW`Y]XYbXYf
GW`f]hh`]b`X]Y`Ni _i bZi`XYg`XYi hgW`Yb: fUi YbZi » VU`g`gY]bž`k c
Ni j Yfg]W`hž`HYUa [Y]gh'i bX`J YfhfUi Yb`k Y]hYf`]b`]a `A]hhY`di b_h
ghY`Yb"

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W`Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`b!U["XY